Places and Spaces in the Lives of Marginalized Children

An Investigation of NGOs' Work with Finding and Creating Safety for Children Exposed to Torture and Other Forms of Violence in the Philippines



Source: Aarhus University 2019

Sarah Staub – 201707197 Master Thesis Project // MA International Studies Aarhus University // School of Culture and Society Supervisor AU // Annette Skovsted Hansen In collaboration w. DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture Co-supervisor DIGNITY // Tomas Max Martin Summer Exam // 01.06.22 Number of characters: 160.748





Abstract

Marginalized children, such as street children and children in conflict with the law, are at high risk of encounters with torture and other forms of violence. These children are often on the move and their pathways thus consist of encounters with many different places. Concepts such as 'places' and 'spaces' are thus relevant to examine. The aim of this thesis project is to investigate 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines in order to analyze and discuss how different NGOs understand, experience, and utilize these concepts in their work with children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence.

NGOs as actors dominate this field, as there is not much academic research to be found within the field. The project is therefore conducted in collaboration with DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture. In addition, three Philippine NGOs have been included in the fieldwork which creates the basis for examining how different NGOs approach the issue of torture and other forms of violence against children as well as make sense of the children's situations. In order to answer the thesis statement, a methodological approach of mixed methods is adapted in which qualitative data has been collected through semi-structured interviews, online field observations and various project reports and documents. The theoretical framework is based on a dynamic approach to 'place' and 'space' theories, drawing on the key thinkers Yi-Fu Tuan (1977), Michel de Certeau (1984) and Tim Cresswell (2015). The theoretical framework will together with the analysis open up for a discussion of how different NGOs understand, experience, and utilize these concepts in their work with children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence.

The analysis shows that 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines are characterized by everyday violence, a struggle for survival, and a constant motion of the children. The analysis finds that in the examination of 'safe places' a more abstract understanding of the concept emerges, as 'places' are transformed into 'spaces'. The thesis concludes that 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines are dominated by everyday violence, in which finding and creating safe 'places' and 'spaces' is a crucial part of understanding the pathways of the children. It is concluded that a dynamic understanding of the concepts 'place' and 'space' opens up an understanding of how the NGOs work with marginalized children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence. The way the NGOs use 'place' and 'space' in their work becomes an important part of how they approach the children.

Table of Content

Abstract	2
List of Acronyms	5
Chapter 1: Introduction	6
1.1 Torture and Other Forms of Violence Against Children	6
1.1.1 The Philippines – a Highly Inflamed Political Climate	6
1.1.2 Definition of Terms	7
1.1.3 A Collaboration between NGOs	
1.2 Framing the Study – 'Places' and 'Spaces' in the Lives of Marginalized Children	10
1.3 Outline of Thesis	11
Chapter 2: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework	11
2.1 Literature Review	12
2.1.1 Shedding Light on a Hidden Practice	12
2.1.2 Conceptualizing Torture Against Children	14
2.1.3 Places and Spaces of Torture and Other Forms of Violence Against Children	15
2.2 Theoretical Framework	16
2.2.1 Place and Space – an Overview	17
2.2.2 Defining Place and Space	
2.2.3 A Dynamic Approach	
Chapter 3: Methodology	21
3.1 Types of Material	21
3.1.1 'Following The Child' – Entering the Field	
3.1.2 Approaches to Interviews	24
3.1.3 Analytical Approach	
3.2 Ethical Considerations and Limitations	
3.2.1 Child Torture – a Highly Sensitive Subject	
3.2.2 A Dual Position – Being an Insider and an Outsider	
Chapter 4: Analysis	
4.1 Places and Spaces in the Lives of Marginalized Children	

4.1.1 A Description of Manila through a Child-Centered View	
4.1.2 Places of Children – a Daily Struggle	
4.1.3 Finding 'Safe Spaces' – Transforming Place into Space	
4.2 Approaching the Children	
4.2.1 Bahay Pag-Asa as a Place – 'Following The Child' Creating Spaces	
4.2.2 Stairway as a Place Creating Spaces	
4.2.3 Children's Rights as a Language	
4.2.4 Approaching the Children through Trust and Time	
4.3 Summary of Key Findings	
Chapter 5: Discussion	
5.1 Children in-between Places in Everyday of Violence	
5.1.1 Places of an Everyday Violence	
5.1.2 In-between Places – a Dynamic Place	
5.1.3 Being Out-of-Place	
5.2 "We are Safe Spaces"	
5.2.1 NGOs Going Beyond Places	
5.2.2 Spaces Allowing Children to be Children	
5.2.3 People as Spaces	
5.3 Approaching the Unspeakable – NGOs Creating Spaces	
5.3.1 Creating a Language without Words	
5.3.2 Human Rights as a Discourse	
Chapter 6: Conclusion	
6.1 Reflections	
List of References	65
Appendix 1: Consent Forms for Interview	72

List of Acronyms

- CAR Children At Risk
- CICL Children In Conflict with the Law
- CIDTP Cruel, Inhuman, and Degrading Treatment or Punishment
- CLRDC Children's Legal Rights and Development Centre
- CSO Civil Society Organization
- 'FTC' 'Following The Child'
- NGO Non-Government Organization
- OMCT World Organization Against Torture
- SFI Stairway Foundation Inc.
- UNCAT United Nations Convention Against Torture
- UNCRC The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Torture and Other Forms of Violence Against Children

Torture against children is a widespread phenomenon that takes place daily all over the world. Children are both at risk and exposed to torture and other forms of violence as a result of an everchanging and at times unstable world in which democracies as well as human rights are constantly compromised (Pérez-Sales 2019, 12). At the same time, torture against children is a phenomenon which has received relatively little academic research attention over the years despite the fact that several human rights reports suggest that torture against children is a reality (Alayarian 2009, 146). Human rights organizations including non-governmental organizations (NGOs) around the world have for a long time sounded the alarm concerning this hidden practice and have for decades been watchdogs putting torture against children on the world agenda. Yet, torture against children is a phenomenon that can be and often is difficult to assess as it is a highly sensitive subject (OMCT 2021, 13). Another issue is that torture is often a part of a larger discourse around violence against children (Pérez-Sales 2019, 2). However, by broadening the concept to include 'other forms of violence', it becomes easier to investigate the phenomenon. In addition, we shall see how challenging it is to separate torture from other forms of violence and abuse.

"Eighty per cent of Filipino children have experienced some form of violence at home, in school, in their community and online" (UNICEF Philippines 2016). This is a statement from a national study conducted in the Philippines in 2016 by the Council for the Welfare of Children and UNICEF Philippines. According to this study children in the Philippines face a high risk of violence in their everyday life both in their homes, in school and in the community. This means that the children are at risk of violence in several arenas, making it difficult for them to escape. Moreover, it is a statement that captures and expresses an issue that is part of the everyday life and reality for millions of children in the Philippines (UNICEF Philippines 2016).

1.1.1 The Philippines – a Highly Inflamed Political Climate

The Philippines is in many ways a country of contrasts. It is a country of wild nature and peace as well as a country of concrete jungles and distress. The latter is the harsh reality that millions of Filipinos face on an everyday basis. Poverty is a dominating and damaging determinant. In the first part of 2021, 23.7 % of the Philippine population lived under the poverty line, which correspond to 26.14 million people (Philippine Statistics Authority 2021). Still, this is an estimate, because there

are unreported numbers especially among children and street children in particular. Children in general are proven to be particularly vulnerable and in high risk of poverty including the consequences that follows, such as violence and exploitation (UNICEF Philippines 2021, 26). This harsh reality thus becomes a driving force of an increased risk of violence against children.

Marginalized children in the Philippines, including street children and children in conflict with the law (CICL), are particular at high risk of encounters with violence and injustice (Legaspi-Medina 2020, 116). This is among other things a consequence of the political context and reality of the Philippines, which is highly inflamed. Particular, the last four years have been dominated by a 'tough on crime' policy including the so-called 'War on Drugs' carried out by the President Rodrigo Duterte. This has resulted in torture and extrajudicial killings of thousands of people including children (OMCT & CLRDC 2020, 3). Moreover, the pandemic COVID-19 has had serious consequences for the population. Especially, the more vulnerable groups of the population, including children, have suffered severe human rights violations in the form of violent and abusive treatments and degrading punishments (Wurth & Conde 2020). The 'war on drugs' as well as the pandemic of COVID-19, have in many ways reinforced the underlying structures and cases of everyday violence in the Philippines, which children are particular vulnerable to. This inflamed political climate makes it very difficult to be a child, and especially a marginalized child, in the Philippines. It does not only illustrate the harsh reality that far too many children live under in the Philippines and particularly Manila, but also emphasizes the relevance and importance of the topic.

1.1.2 Definition of Terms

In this section follow definitions of a number of terms that have particular significance in the work with children's rights as well as with the issue of torture and other forms of violence. These terms will be used throughout the thesis.

A child – children in this thesis will be defined on the basis of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC), which means that every human being under the age of 18 is regarded as a child (United Nations 1989, article 1).

Children At Risk (CAR) – refers to vulnerable children who are "[...] at risk of committing criminal offenses because of personal, family and social circumstances" (Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of

the Philippines 2006, (d)). These circumstances include a number of violations against the child such as all forms of abuse and exploitation. Additionally, it also includes socio-economic conditions that have profound consequences for the child as well as external factors such as armed conflicts (Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines 2006, (d)).

Children In Conflict with the Law (CICL) – this term is in this thesis defined in accordance with the Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines, which refer to children in conflict with the law (CICL) as "[...] a child who is alleged as, accused of, or adjudged as having committed an offense under Philippine laws." (Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines 2006, (e)).

Torture and Other Forms of Violence – in this thesis, torture is defined on the basis of the United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (UNCAT). Here torture is defined as "[...] any act by which severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person for such purposes as obtaining from him or a third person information or a confession, punishing him for an act he or a third person has committed or is suspected of having committed, or intimidating or coercing him or a third person, or for any reason based on discrimination of any kind, when such pain or suffering is inflicted by or at the instigation of or with the consent or acquiescence of a public official or other person acting in an official capacity." (United Nations 1984, article 1). In addition, 'other forms of violence' is included in this term, which drawing on the UNCRC refer to both physical and mental violence, forms of abuse and exploitation (United Nations 1989, article 19). I use the term 'torture and other forms of violence' throughout the thesis, when referring to the human rights violations the children encounter.

1.1.3 A Collaboration between NGOs

During the fall of 2021, I was interning at DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture¹ as part of my education at Aarhus University. DIGNITY is a Danish NGO that fights globally for "[...] a world without torture and cruel inhuman, and degrading treatment." (About DIGNITY 2022). DIGNITY works with different partner organizations, including NGOs and civil society organizations (CSOs), as well as government authorities both locally and globally (About DIGNITY 2022). As an intern, I was mainly associated with a project in the Philippines called 'Following The Child: Integrated protection of children along their pathway through the juvenile justice and welfare system in the

¹ From now on referred to as DIGNITY.

Philippines' ('FTC'). This is a project funded by the EU and the Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs running in a 3-year timeframe ending within the year of 2022. The project takes place in the urban resettlement area of Bagong Silang, Caloocan City in Manila. This is a place dominated by "[...] high rates of unemployment, poverty, and a high crime rate." (DIGNITY 2018, 5). Children are in particular vulnerable to these living circumstances, as they are at high risk of getting involved in crime activities and thus becoming victims of violent encounters with authorities (DIGNITY 2018, 5). The 'FTC' project aims to "[...] build sustainable protection against torture and CIDTP² committed against children in their contacts with public officials and institutions of the social welfare and juvenile justice system by following the child's pathway from families and communities into institutions and back again." (DIGNITY 2018, 8). With my engagement in this particular project, I became aware of the alarming issue of torture and other forms of violence against children.

In the project 'Following The Child', DIGNITY has worked in collaboration with the partner organizations Balay Rehabilitation Center³ and Children's Legal Rights and Development Center, Inc.⁴ that are both Filipino NGOs located in Manila. Balay is a human rights NGO working with children and youth, who has been subjected to torture and organized violence (About Balay 2022). Furthermore, the organization has a history of working with DIGNITY. CLRDC is too a human rights NGO who protects and promotes children's rights by among other things providing legal services and programs for children who has been subjected to any kind of abuse or exploitation (About CLRDC 2022). Together, the three NGOs have a strong focus as well as expertise in the field of torture, which gives the project 'FTC' both depth and breadth. Additionally, the two Filipino NGOs have a particular focus on children, contributing with experiences and knowledge that complements DIGNITY's work.

In order to expand my knowledge about the thesis statement, I have included the Philippine NGO Stairway Foundation Inc.⁵ in the thesis project as another source of expertise. Stairway is an NGO and a children's rights organization that since 1990 has worked with marginalized children in the Philippines, particularly from Manila, as well as fought for children's rights for more than 30 years (About Stairway 2022). Stairway has a particular focus on combating child sexual abuse and

² CIDTP = Cruel, inhuman, and degrading treatment or punishment (United Nations. 1984. "Article 1" United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment)

³ From now on referred to as Balay.

⁴ From now on referred to as CLRDC.

⁵ From now on referred to as Stairway.

exploitation both online and offline and is specialized in this area. In this thesis project, I will mainly, focus on their 'Family Home Program', which is a one year program for former street children, who before they come to Stairway have stayed in government institutions and centers in Manila. When being a part of the 'Family Home Program' "[...] the children are engaged in non-formal education, psychosocial interventions, creative therapy, livelihood skills training, sports [...]" and more (Stairway Family Home 2022).

DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC have in their work with 'FTC' a focus on combating torture against children, whereas Stairway has in their work a focus on preventing child sexual abuse and exploitation. In this way, the NGOs have two different languages to address the violations the children encounter. The project of 'FTC' and the work of Stairway are two different projects yet with a common focus on marginalized children and human rights. In this thesis, I draw on experience and knowledge from both projects and the associated NGOs and I will thus be using the definition 'torture and other forms of violence' to include both projects.

1.2 Framing the Study - 'Places' and 'Spaces' in the Lives of Marginalized Children

Marginalized children are found in a variety of places. Especially children living in poor areas or in the streets are constantly in contiguity with different places and people at different times. In this way, the children are found in and between places. Particularly, the 'in between' places are interesting to examine, because they have a dynamic dimension in the way they follow and develop along with the constant motion of the children.

Places of torture and other forms of violence against children are well known to the NGO world and the literature within the field (Marc 2016, 566). Therefore, I wish to take this starting point and expand it further by applying a dynamic understanding of the concept of 'place' as well as include the concept of 'space' in the equation. I thus argue that there is an interesting dimension to the concepts of 'place' and 'space' especially in regard to the lives of marginalized children, where the practice of everyday violence creates unsafe places for children in the community. Therefore, I believe that these concepts are interesting to explore, as they create an understanding of the situations of the children as well as how NGOs approach the issue of torture and other forms of violence against children. Leading me to the following thesis statement:

An investigation of 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines in order to analyze and discuss how different NGOs understand, experience, and utilize these concepts in their work with children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence.

1.3 Outline of Thesis

The following chapter, **chapter two**, consists of a literature review and the theoretical framework applied in the thesis. **Chapter three** outlines the methodological approach adapted in this thesis as well as the different types of material collected. In addition, it examines the ethical considerations and limitations of the thesis. In **chapter four**, the collected material is analyzed on the basis of an identification and examination of key themes and patterns. The chapter is divided into two parts. First part focuses on 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of marginalized children. The second part examines how the NGOs approach the issue of violence and torture against children as well as make sense of the situation of the children through a creation of 'spaces'. Based on the findings from the analysis, I discuss, in **chapter five**, how the NGOs understand, experience and utilize the concepts of 'place' and 'space' in their work with marginalized children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence. Drawing on the theoretical framework, demonstrated in chapter two, I discuss how a dynamic understanding of 'place' and 'space' can provide an insight into the NGOs work with the children. Finally, **chapter six** will conclude on the findings and discussion examined throughout the thesis.

Chapter 2: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

The following chapter is divided into two parts. The first part outlines a research review of the existing literature within the field of torture and other forms of violence against children. The aim is to identify key areas, and debates within the field as well as the gaps. It serves to place the current study within a larger framework. The second part outlines the theoretical framework, which forms the basis of the analysis as well as the discussion. The two parts are placed together in this chapter, since there is a strong connection between the literature review and the theoretical framework, as they reinforce each other.

2.1 Literature Review

During my internship at DIGNITY, I examined the existing literature and studies within the field of 'Children and Torture', which resulted in an unpublished literature overview⁶. Based on 425 abstracts on the field of 'Children and Torture', where a number of articles were analyzed in depth, I was able to identify key areas and research within the field of children and torture. This literature overview will serve as the basis for the literature review conducted as a part of this thesis project, since it covers the thematic focus on torture and other forms of violence against children, and places my current study within a larger framework of the field.

The literature review includes both academic articles, papers, and gray literature i.e., NGO reports. This creates a dynamic field, in which different types of literature illuminate each other. However, it turns out that little academic research has been written about the theme and the majority of the literature is thus dominated by gray literature (Alayarian 2009, 146). Findings from the literature overview conducted within the framework of DIGNITY suggest a number of themes and areas of research, that dominates the body of literature, and at the same time the gaps within the field. However, only a strain of research literature is particularly relevant to my thesis project, and this will be outlined in the following chapter. The literature review of this thesis covers a discussion of the following themes and fields: the impact and dominance of gray literature, hence the role of the NGO world, conceptualizing torture against children, and 'places' and 'spaces' of torture against children.

2.1.1 Shedding Light on a Hidden Practice

As mentioned above, the majority of the literature within the field is dominated by gray literature, as NGOs over the years have been the driving force in which torture and other forms of violence against children has been put on the agenda (Staub 2021, 4). Back in 2000, Amnesty International put child torture on the global agenda in a comprehensive publication called *Hidden scandal, secret shame* — *Torture and ill-treatment of children* (2000). The report draws on several other reports and documentations by Amnesty International themselves, but also a number of other human rights organizations (Amnesty International 2000, 1). Through a focus on international legal standards and the UNCRC, field research, and documentation of children's stories from different parts of the world, the report sheds light on the existing and growing practice of torture against children. Despite the fact that the report was published more than twenty years ago it remains highly relevant in its agenda.

⁶ Unpublished report. Work by Sarah Staub during internship at DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture.

According to PhD psychiatrist Pau Pérez-Sales (2019) the report was groundbreaking in its focus on "[...] legislation and areas of concern relating to children and torture", and for that reason it is still referred to in other more recent articles published in journals and gray literature (Pérez-Sales 2019, 1). The fact that today's research still refers to this report, even twenty years after its publication, underlines not only the importance of the work, but also the need to still shed light on this hidden practice.

NGOs and human rights organizations have for decades sought to put child torture and other forms of violence on the world agenda by publishing reports, that all share stories of children as victims of torture and other forms of violence and points out what needs to be done to prevent these practices. In my work of mapping out the existing literature in the field, I have come across several reports and studies conducted and published by different NGOs and human rights organizations such as the Human Rights Watch (2020) as well as more specific children's organizations such as CLRDC (2020) to mention a few. Particularly, the World Organisation Against Torture (OMCT) frequently publishes reports and work documenting cases of torture, including cases of children from all over the world. In 2020, OMCT published a comprehensive report in collaboration with CLRDC, on extrajudicial killings and cases of torture against children in the Philippines (OMCT & CLRDC 2020). These reports have served as an effective way of contextualizing the issue of torture and other forms of violence against children, because they point towards knowledge within the field as well as emphasize gaps by making recommendations for improvement. The body of literature depicts that the NGOs continue to shed light on the practice of torture and other forms of violence against children through documenting cases and sharing knowledge on the issue. This further emphasizes the relevance of including different NGOs in my fieldwork to answer the thesis statement.

With this dominance of the NGO world, a certain discourse around the knowledge is created. One has to be aware of, how the knowledge production is dominated by the NGO world and values on human rights. Thus, a particular type of knowledge dominates the field. This can possibly create a tension between the knowledge production of the NGO world, which is much more practical oriented and the academic world which is more theoretical. In this literature review, I draw on knowledge from both worlds, but based on the above findings, the NGO world will dominate my point of view.

2.1.2 Conceptualizing Torture Against Children

Academic articles and journals touch upon some of the same knowledge as gray literature do, but the academic knowledge is often debated or illuminated from a more academic perspective. A striking finding from the various literature is that 'torture' is a rarely used word when it comes to children. Instead, more often words such as 'violence' and 'abuse' are used (Staub 2021, 7). This suggests that torture against children is mostly not addressed directly but rather in a much broader discourse on violence and abuse against children (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 9). This is especially the case for most of the academic work and publications in various journals, whereas the gray literature often tends to address torture against children by articulating the issue in a more direct manner. In the publication Untold stories – Child Torture – Addressing a horrific practice (2012), which is a comprehensive report shedding light on the practice of child torture, Line Baagø-Rasmussen addresses this exact aspect of conceptualizing torture against children. She emphasizes how torture against children is often "[...] embedded in a wider discourse on violence against children in which distinctions between child torture and child abuse are blurred." (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 9). This is a striking argument as it suggests how torture against children is often dominated by a particular linguistic and conceptualized discourse. A relevant debate in this regard is whether it even matters how we label it. In other words, what difference does it make if we call it abuse, violence or torture against children? This will be investigated later in the discussion, where I wish to map out and understand how different NGOs work with and articulate torture and other forms of violence against children as well as what this means.

Corporal punishment is another visible aspect in the literature and is also an important quantity to highlight, as it often becomes a part of a gray area, where torture and other forms of violence against children are easily overlooked. Baagø-Rasmussen argues that "[...] in countries where corporal punishment is accepted, torture and cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (CIDT) may be seen as a form of corporal punishment." (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 11). She claims that this acceptance of corporal punishment contributes to concealing actual cases of torture and other forms of violence against children, as they are overlooked in this larger discourse on violence (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 26). Whether corporal punishment should be considered torture or not is argued further by Patrick Lenta in the article "Is Corporal Punishment Torturous?" (2017) in *Journal of Applied Philosophy*. Thoroughly and systematically, he argues that since 'punishment' is included in the definition of torture in the UNCAT, corporal punishment also falls under acts of torture (Lenta

2017, 77). This is a complex debate with many dimensions to include. The argument is that torture and other forms of violence against children are concealed in a larger practice of everyday violence, where punishments committed by authorities often are seen as necessary measurements rather than as a violation of children's rights. In this way, torture and other forms of violence become a larger part of everyday violence, which to a large extent is accepted. This is particularly the case in the Philippines, where corporal punishment is a widely accepted practice (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 26). Hence, the everyday violence becomes a more varied way of understanding torture and other forms of violence committed against children. Yet, I find that the debate lacks a more varied focus on what dimensions the practice of everyday violence mean. If we are to understand everyday violence, we need to understand the practice of it better.

2.1.3 Places and Spaces of Torture and Other Forms of Violence Against Children

Children are found in different situations and locations in their everyday lives. A framework particular dominating the field is literature on 'place' and 'space', which mainly is focused on specific places in which children are subjected to or in risk of being subjected to torture and other forms of violence. Places, such as detention and the streets, are especially highlighted in the literature (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 50). However, the body of literature suggests that children are at risk of torture and other forms of violence in many places, which makes this field highly relevant and complex to examine (Quiroga 2009, 69). Both gray literature and academic articles address the theme of 'places' and 'spaces' of torture against children. The gray literature does this by documenting through case studies what particularly places children are at risk of being subjected to torture, whereas the academic work and research mostly examine this by including who these children are. In the article "Torture in Children" (2009) published in the quarterly Journal on Journal on Rehabilitation of Torture Victims and Prevention of Torture, Jose Quiroga argues, based on a literature review, that children subjected to or at risk of being subjected to torture can be divided into two main groups determined by the context: peace time and war time (Quiroga 2009, 66). Quiroga points towards street children, children in conflict with the law (CICL), and children in detention as the high-risk groups of torture and other forms of violence during peace time. Children at risk at war time are also children in detention, but additionally child soldiers, and particular refugees (Quiroga 2009, 66). This thesis will only focus on the former group of children, as it examines 'places' and 'spaces' of marginalized children living in poor areas or on the streets of Manila, and thus including street children, CICL, and children in detention. Quiroga even argues that "[...] the majority of torture victims happen during peace time"

(Quiroga 2009, 66). This indicates a focus on everyday violence against children, which in many cases, as mentioned earlier in the examples by various gray literature, are cases of torture. However, both groups of children are worth mentioning, as it emphasizes the scope of the field being investigated. Furthermore, the concepts of 'place' and 'space' provide a framework for examining everyday violence in the lives of marginalized children.

'Places' are relevant to examine, yet most of the literature and studies have already mapped these out. Studies within both gray literature and academic articles show that much knowledge is found on *where* children are at risk of torture and other forms of violence (Marc 2016, 566). However, there is less focus on what happens between these places. For instance, Baagø-Rasmussen makes the argument that "[...] the time gap between the arrest of the child and when the child is referred to an institutional capacity creates a high risk of torture." (Baagø-Rasmussen 2012, 50). Thus, the literature points towards torture and other forms of violence as also happening between places, or what I wish to refer to as the 'in between' places, as they point to an encounter with certain people, e.g., the police, in everyday violence rather than specific places. Hence, these are not necessarily specific places, as they are shaped by the people and practice of the specific place. I wish to take my starting point in the existing debate within the literature, but I develop this further by shifting the focus from the examination of specific places of torture and violence against children, to a more abstract understanding of these by examining them as dynamic concepts. Therefore, I find that 'place' and 'space' are interesting concepts to examine. In order to examine this further, I need to include and draw on theories on 'place' and 'space'.

2.2 Theoretical Framework

The following section outlines the theoretical framework applied to the thesis project. It provides a brief overview of different theories on 'place' and 'space', but mainly focuses on the specific theories and key thinkers that will create the basis for the theoretical framework of this thesis. 'Place' and 'space' can be and are many different things to many different people. Furthermore, they are concepts that are studied across disciplines even though they are traditionally rooted in the field of geography (Cresswell 2015, 1). This means that narrowing the concepts down to one specific definition may be challenging, as they are complex concepts to define and understand. On the other hand, this also means that 'place' and 'space' can be examined from many different perspectives and thus pave the way for other and perhaps new interpretations. In this thesis I draw on key thinkers from the

disciplines of philosophy, human geography and anthropology. Specifically, the humanistic geographer Yi-Fu Tuan and the philosopher and anthropologist Michel De Certeau will form the basis of my theoretical framework. Additionally, I draw on perspectives from the humanistic geographer Tim Cresswell.

2.2.1 Place and Space – an Overview

'Place' and 'space' are common words that are a part of our everyday life, and we use the words without really putting much thought into our understanding of them. As Yi-Fu Tuan writes in his book *Space and Place – The Perspective of Experience* (1977) "[...] space and place are basic components of the lived world; we take them for granted." (Tuan 2018, 3). According to Tuan 'place' and 'space' are not just terms that we use in our daily lives, but rather an inherent part of life. In the book *Place: An Introduction* (2015), Tim Cresswell takes this further and argues how these concepts are a way of understanding the world (Cresswell 2015, 18). Additionally, in the book *The Practice of Everyday Life* (1984), Michel de Certeau argues that 'places' and 'spaces' are a part of the practice of everyday life, hence the title (Certeau 1988, 117). With these overall understandings it becomes highly relevant concepts to examine, as they, according to Tuan, Cresswell, and Certeau are embedded in the way we are, comprehend, and practice the world.

Various researchers and theorists across disciplines have for decades contributed to the study of 'place' and 'space'. To the discipline of geography, 'place' has for a long time been a key concept but not necessarily explored as a phenomenological idea. This came with the "[...] emergence of humanistic geography founded on phenomenology [...]" during the 1970s (Cresswell 2015, 54). Here, the field took a new turn, where the discipline of geography engaged with the field of philosophy (Cresswell 2015, 35). With this, 'place' became much more of an idea describing a way of understanding and being in the world, rather than a concept limited to describing certain locations in the world. One of the key thinkers and, in some way, a predecessor within this turn, is Tuan. With his work *Topophilia* (1974) and *Space and Place – The Perspective of Experience* (1977), in which I will be focusing on the latter, he revolutionized the idea of 'place'. One of the main arguments through his work, is that "[...] place is an organized world of meaning", and that we familiarize ourselves with the world through places (Tuan 2018, 179). According to Tuan, we understand the world through experiences with place. This way of thinking of 'place' thus becomes my theoretical starting point and one of my main arguments for examining 'place' and 'space' in this thesis. Hence, 'place' and 'space' become

key in understanding the lives of marginalized children and their encounter with torture and other forms of violence as well as how NGOs approach this.

Several thinkers from different theoretical traditions have contributed and developed various theoretical approaches and debates influenced by each other through critique and elaborations. According to Cresswell, 'place' is mostly approached from three different, yet compatible, categories. The first approach is a descriptive approach in which 'place' is concrete and understood as locations. Regional geographers mainly dominate this field. The second approach is a social constructivist approach, where 'place' is perceived as a product of social processes. In other words, 'place' is a constructed thing. It is often Marxist, feminist, or poststructuralist traditions that dominate this field (Cresswell 2015, 56). Important thinkers within this tradition are Henri Lefebvre, David Harvey, and Doreen Massey to name a few (Hubbard & Kitchin 2011, 5). The last approach is a phenomenological one, which is an approach, that humanistic geographers and philosophers often take. Key thinkers within this field are Yi-Fu Tuan and Edward Relph (Hubbard & Kitchin 2011, 6). This is focused more on 'place' rather than 'places' and human existence (Cresswell 2015, 56). I highlight these categories to emphasize the broadness and diversity that the different theories and approaches to the concepts 'place' and 'space' have. In my analysis and discussion, I will take a phenomenological approach to the concepts by drawing on Tuan, and a more anthropological approach by including Certeau. Furthermore, I take on a social constructionist approach, as I draw on Cresswell (1996) and his notion about being 'out-of-place'. This will be discussed later.

2.2.2 Defining Place and Space

In order to use the concepts 'place' and 'space' as a theoretical framework I need to define and clarify what I mean with these concepts and nonetheless how I attend to use them. I will be defining the two concepts based on the theories of Tuan and Certeau, and then place myself within this theoretical framework by drawing on perspectives from both and creating my own take. As mentioned earlier, 'place' and 'space' can mean many things depending on the theoretical lens one take. Overall, the literature within the field of human geography shares a general understanding of 'place' as something with a meaning (Cresswell 2014, 4). According to Tuan the concepts are defined as:

"[...] "Space" is more abstract than "place". What begins as undifferentiated space becomes place as we get to know it better and endow it with value [...] The ideas "space" and "place"

require each other for definition [...] if we think of space as that which allows movement, then place is pause; each pause in movement makes it possible for location to be transformed into place" (Tuan 2018, 6).

With this definition place becomes something concrete and stable. On the other hand, 'space' is to be understood as something more abstract and as movements and it thus becomes more dynamic. In this way, the two concepts are defined in a comparison but without eliminating each other. According to Tuan, place and space are not opposite to each other, but rather say something about each other and by this the two concepts become a part of each other's definition. According to Tuan, place has a meaning which is created by the so called 'pauses' within the movements that space is. It is through these pauses that one becomes involved in the world, and by this place becomes a way of "[...] being in the world" (Cresswell 2015, 35). These pauses are rather significant, when examining the patterns of movements of the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines, because they raise the question whether the definitions of pause (place) and movements (space) can be applied to the study of children's pathways and encounter with torture and other forms of violence.

The concept of being 'out-of-place' is presented in the work *In Place/Out of Place: Geography, Ideology, and Transgression* (1996) by Cresswell. His main argument is that people and things can be 'in-place' and particularly 'out-of-place'. In this way, places and spaces are a part of socially constructing the world (Cresswell 1996, 9). This notion of being 'out-of-place' has a potential to examine 'places' and 'spaces' in the lives of the children in Manila, who are often found in many places. This will be explored further in the analysis and discussion.

Michel de Certeau and *The Practice of Everyday Life* (1984) is another unavoidable work and theoretical apparatus when it comes to the idea of 'place' and 'space', and in particular how these are practiced in an everyday life (Cresswell 2015, 70). In this work, he draws on anthropological and philosophical approaches when defining 'place' and 'space'. Certeau distinguishes between 'space' (espace) and 'place' (lieu) without opposing the two with each other. He defines 'place' as stability consisting of concrete positions, whereas 'space' is dynamic and "occurs as the effect produced by the operations that orient it, situate it, temporalize it [...]" (Certeau 1988, 117). To explain this, Certeau presents a metaphor of linguistic, where place should be understood as words and when practiced they become sentences, which is space. To Certeau, space is what has a meaning and it gain its meaning through practice. To him "space is a practiced place" (Certeau 1988, 117). As mentioned,

MA Thesis Project – International Studies Supervisor: Annette Skovsted Hansen

Certeau defines place as stability and as something concrete, but if space is a practiced place, then place becomes dynamic as it is transformable. In other words, if space is a practiced place, this means that places can change according to the practice of it, and by this is constantly negotiated. Places are thus made and remade in everyday life (Cresswell 2015, 70). This is an important aspect to be aware of when examining both places and spaces in the lives of the children in Manila, as well as how NGOs use place and space in their work with the children. Further, it becomes an argument for using Certeau in my discussion, as I see an interesting connection between the theoretical framework of Certeau and his "practice of everyday life" (understanding place and space as dynamic) to the everyday violence happening in the Philippines as well as the movements of the children.

2.2.3 A Dynamic Approach

Tuan and Certeau's definitions of place and space are fundamentally similar. Both understand place as concrete and stable, and space as more abstract and dynamic. However, they differ from each other in their use of the two concepts. As previously mentioned, Tuan defines place as something that has a meaning, where this is space to Certeau. Common to the two is, however, that they do not see place and space as opposites to each other, but rather as connected elements that cannot stand alone. To both Tuan and Certeau, the two concepts reinforce each other, creating a depth. As mentioned in previous section, my aim is to shift the focus from the examination of specific places, also known as locations, of torture and violence against children, to a more abstract understanding of these by examining them as dynamic concepts. Both Tuan and Certeau are an evident starting point for this.

Tuan has some interesting aspects when it comes to place and space. The concrete and stable place has value and meaning, and it is through this that we understand the world. I believe this aspect is interesting in my investigation of places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children, as they are found in several places, and thus *are* in the world in certain ways. Yet, I find that Tuan's approach to some extent lacks a more dynamic focus on place or perhaps even a greater focus on space as a concept. This is where Certeau's interpretation of place and space offers new opportunities and most important a dynamic approach to the concepts. In line with this, Cresswell argues that "[...] thinking of place as performed and practiced can help us think of place in radically open and non-essentialized ways, where place is constantly struggled over and reimagined in practical ways. [...]" (Cresswell 2015, 71). This is an important perspective and one of the main reasons why I adopt a dynamic approach to place and space. Certeau's definition of place and space allows a more dynamic

understanding of the concepts, which further allows me to examine places and spaces in the lives of children as dynamic and changeable. It is this exact changeability, which I believe can provide me with an understanding of how different NGOs approach the issue of torture and other forms of violence by working with place and space.

Chapter 3: Methodology

The following chapter outlines the methodological approach applied in this thesis to examine and analyze places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children in Manila as well as how different NGOs approach the issue of torture and other forms of violence against children. The chapter outlines the different types of material collected for the analysis and explains in detail how the samplings have been conducted and why the methodological approaches contribute to the assessment of the thesis statement. Finally, this chapter will discuss and reflect upon the ethical considerations and limitations, that I have come across during the project.

3.1 Types of Material

Overall, the thesis is based on a mixed methods approach where I collected material in mainly three ways consisting of semi-structured interviews with four different NGOs; one Danish and three Filipino, online field observations of bi-weekly and internal meetings across partner organizations, and finally various project reports and documents from the project 'Following The Child' ('FTC'). These methods are especially ideal for collecting material for answering my research question, because they allow me to open up the reality through emerging myself with it. In addition, the mixed methods approach provides a more in-depth analysis, where different material collected through different methods together complement each other in the answering of a common research question (Yin 2009, 63). According to Robert Yin (2009) the mixed methods approach allows the researcher to "[...] address more complicated research questions and collect a richer and stronger array of evidence than can be accomplished by a single method alone." (Yin 2009, 63). Thus, the mix of methods illuminates the research question from different angles, which creates a richer and deeper understanding of the research question. The mixed methods approach is often defined as a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods. However, Yin emphasizes that data can be found within either quantitative or qualitative data (Yin 2009, 63). The mixed methods approach applied in this thesis, builds on qualitative data gathered through the methods listed above.

3.1.1 'Following The Child' – Entering the Field

Common to the material consisting of project reports and documents is that they are mainly gathered from different NGOs. Since this project is carried out in collaboration with DIGNITY, I have had access to resources of knowledge and practices through various project reports and documents as well as relevant people. This collaboration allowed me to continue my work with the project 'FTC', which I was associated with during my internship at DIGNITY. This means, that a broad understanding of the project 'FTC' and good relationships with colleagues at partner organizations in the Philippines were already established prior to this thesis project. This created an ideal starting point, as already existing knowledge and well-established relationships could pave the way for gathering the material. The material collected on the basis of my collaboration with the NGOs DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC consist of knowledge from various project reports and documents as well as practices from the project gained through various interviews conducted with the team. The different project reports and documents from 'FTC' serve as a way of creating knowledge and context for the thesis project and thus creates a foundation for answering the thesis statement.

Initially, the reports and documents were the foundation for the analysis, but as the thesis project evolved, new opportunities emerged. The process of reading and interpretating the different project reports and documents provided me with an enriched understanding of the field. The reports and documents became a way for me to open up the project and through this explore the field. The analysis and interpretation of the reports and documents, related to the field, allowed for exploration of the field and delimitation of information as knowledge became deeper and more specified. Because the reports and documents created context for the project, the material became a source of knowledge and thus a methodological grip for developing the interview guidelines. It went from being relevant data in itself to also creating a foundation for other methodological approaches such as the interviews. Thus, the specific data provides a foundation for creating an important contextual framework for both the methodology and the analysis of the thesis. However, by only examining the 'FTC' project, a risk is that the foundation for examining the thesis statement becomes relatively limited. Therefore, I expanded my access to material and thus my foundation for answering the thesis statement by including knowledge and experience from the NGO Stairway. Additionally, by using a mixed methods approach, I argue that I further ensure a rich body of evidence to answer the thesis statement and thus reduce the risk of the project becoming too one-sided in its answer (Yin 2009, 63).

Another qualitative method used in the collection of material consists of field observations of biweekly meetings between DIGNITY and the Philippine partners Balay and CLRDC on the project 'FTC'. These meetings were an interesting way to gather material, as they became a way of somehow gathering both indirect and direct material of knowledge and practices. Indirect, since they have not provided me with concrete and physical material but rather insights and updates to the project. These meetings allowed for reflection on the project and its different elements as well as questions for elaboration. On the other hand, the meetings served as a direct way of gathering material, as it became a way for me to observe how project reports and documents were translated into reality and how discursive elements from the reports were made visible through the practices expressed at the meetings.

The aim of the field observation was to gain a direct insight of how DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC as NGOs approach the issue of torture and other forms of violence against children through the 'FTC' project. This was the closest I could come to getting an insight into how the project is actually translated into reality and the approaches of the NGOs. Ideally, field observations and even participant observations in the actual field, including Manila, would have provided a better firsthand experience as well as an in-depth understanding of the project. Yet, this does not mean that the material gathered from various reports and documents as well as the online field observations are not valid. These, I argue, are valid as they are comprehensive sources of both knowledge and experience produced by different NGOs and professionals with different strengths and viewpoints. Furthermore, together with the online field observations, I have been able to draw on my own previous experiences with the Philippines. During 2015-2017 I spent a year and a half in the Philippines volunteering at Stairway. This means that I have a relatively good cultural understanding of the country and its people, which proved to be rather useful during the online fieldwork. I could thus draw on own experiences from field trips in Manila and home visits in poor areas and slums. I am convinced that these previous experiences from the field have been crucial for my online fieldwork, as it enabled me to familiarize myself with the conditions and lives of the children in Manila. However, my experience with Stairway also places me in an insider-role within the NGO world. This will be outlined later in this chapter, when I will discuss my own position within the thesis project.

3.1.2 Approaches to Interviews

The interviews, conducted during the fieldwork, mainly took place during the month of March with some interviews in the beginning of April 2022. Initially, all interviews were intended to be conducted, starting in late February and ending in mid-March. However, this was neither possible nor useful to the project, since the planning phase required coordination between several people, ethical considerations and a baseline to ensure a pre-understanding of the field in order to sharpen the focus of the interviews. Instead, a process of identifying participants and planning as well as gaining a knowledge of the field took place during February. The selection of participants took place in collaboration with the project managers of 'FTC' from DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC. However, I found it extremely important as a researcher to work independently and making sure that I was in control of the collection of informants and thus not representing DIGNITY. My role as both an insider to the NGO world and a student and thus a researcher will be discussed more in details later in this chapter under the section 'Ethical Considerations and Limitations'. Before consulting DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC, I already had an idea about who to interview and thus include in the project. Yet, by discussing this across teams it became possible to identify other key participants relevant to the project. The participants were therefore identified through snowball sampling, as the interviews were conducted in a dynamic process, where one interview would lead to new opportunities and other relevant participants (Bryman 2012, 424). Common to all identified participants, however, is that they somehow work with and have experiences with marginalized children in the Philippines. In this way, my research question became a guiding principle for identifying participants. In total, twelve people with different professional backgrounds, from four different NGOs were interviewed, creating a nuanced pool of participants and outcome of the material. Two of the informants come from DIGNITY, three come from Balay and two from CLRDC, making the total number of participants from the 'FTC' team seven. From Stairway, I interviewed five participants.

Early in the process, I decided to go with the flow and partially let the interviews shape each other and the material. This is one of the benefits of working with qualitative data, as this type of data is inductive and explorative (Sovacool et. al. 2018, 18). At the same time, a certain rigor in the collection of the material was maintained even though this can be challenging when dealing with qualitative data, as the risk of bias often occurs when one emerges oneself into the field (Sovacool et. al. 2018, 29). However, a scientific rigor was preserved through a thorough and critical awareness of the methodological approach to the project as well as to how the collected material was analyzed. Sarah Staub

According to Benjamin K. Sovacool et. al., it is precisely this critical awareness of "[...] the strengths and weaknesses of the chosen methods" that ensure a rigorous study (Sovacool et. al. 2018, 30). In this way, I managed to have both a rigorous and an explorative approach to the material. The selected format of the semi-structured interview ensured this dynamic process, as they were open ended interviews that allowed both the interviewer and the interviewee to explore the conversation. Contrary to the unstructured interview, which is known for its limited control, the semi-structured interview is guided by an interview guideline based on a list of questions that are often categorized by specific topics (Bernard 1994, 158). Thus, the interview guideline was guided by semi-structured questions organized according to themes of the research question. According to H. Russell Bernard (1994), the semi-structured interview is an appropriate type of interview when a project does not involve a longterm fieldwork. This type of interview is namely appropriate to use when interviewing a person one time, which is the case of this thesis (Bernard 1994, 157). The interview process was a rather interesting and advantageous process that allowed me to understand the working field as well as directed the path of my thesis project. Another crucial factor, which I believe have had a great impact on my online fieldwork, is how people during and in the aftermath of COVID-19 have become more inclined to engage in online activities. There were some advantages of writing my thesis project and conducting fieldwork in the shadows of COVID-19 where most people have already been familiarized with conducting meetings and work online.

All the interviews were semi-structured interviews conducted as virtual interviews on Skype, Teams and Zoom. The interviews were conducted as 'synchronous' interviews, which is a type of online interview characterized by mirroring a traditional interview though conducted in an online environment. This type of interview allowed me to have a face-to-face interview where interactions could be real and spontaneous (James & Busher 2012, 179). The best case scenario would though have been to have done the interviews face-to-face in real life, but due to COVID-19 and relatively limited time this was not evaluated as an option. However, face-to-face interviews were conducted but instead as virtually versions due to the above circumstances. This meant that I had to do my fieldwork online, which in many ways is very different from conducting fieldwork in "the real world" where one is fully immersed into the lives of the people, cultural and social phenomenon studied. Furthermore, this immersion in the field allows one to have a more comprehensive experience and understanding of the field site (Emerson et al. 2010, 18).

Yet, conducting online fieldwork offers a different way of being in the field, but nonetheless still being in it. It involves an interesting juxtaposition of dealing with being in the field, and at the same time not being there. When doing online fieldwork, the researcher still interacts and engages with participants though it is done in a mediated contact where "[...] listening may involve reading, or it might involve sensing and communicating in other ways." (Pink 2016, 3). In other words, one is still involved in the field, but the way in which this is done often differs from classical fieldwork, as known from the field of anthropology, where one's sensory apparatus plays an important role. Since my interviews and fieldwork took place online, it meant that I was prevented from my sensory impressions of the field site, but instead other elements became relevant. I noticed how I had quickly adapted certain routines prior to the interviews. For instance, making coffee and setting up the computer became a part of my routine. The setup was in my living room where plenty of natural light during the mornings created a warm setting. In fact, most interviews took place during mornings due to time differences with the Philippines. Moreover, ensuring a quiet place without any disturbance was crucial to the interviews. At the same time, drinking the coffee became an important part of my routine, as it created a sense of casualness and in my experience invited the participants to an open and informal conversation. The virtual interviews turned out to be both a flexible and accommodating way of doing fieldwork, as the role of time and place became less relevant. The virtual part meant that instead of me choosing a location for the interview and thus risk choosing a place that my interviewees would not feel comfortable in, the virtually site allowed the interviewee to choose a location of his or her own choice. This, on the other hand, meant that there was a natural distance between us knowing that we were not in the same location. However, my experience was that this actually served as a sort of conversation starter, as we would then talk a bit about the weather, potential time differences and in that way ease our way into the interview. This created an informal atmosphere, which I believe was very helpful to the interviews, as this invited both the interviewee and me to a more relaxed and open approach to the conversation.

Setting the stage for the traditional face-to-face interview is an essential aspect of interviewing. Here, the establishment of good contact between the interviewee and the interviewer is of great importance (Kvale & Brinkmann 2008, 148). The same goes for online interviews, where the distance can make it difficult to create and maintain a trustful relationship. In *The SAGE Handbook of Interview Research: The Complexity of the Craft* (2012) Nalita James and Hugh Busher emphasize the importance of creating a safe and casual environment when conducting online interviews in order to

protect the participants as well as ensuring the best possible outcome (James & Busher 2012, 183). Generally, it was important to me to make sure that the interviewee felt safe and comfortable in sharing thoughts, insights and reflections about a topic, that can be difficult to discuss and which many have a reservation about due to the political situation in the Philippines⁷. Some of the participants also requested to see the questions beforehand and as much as I wanted to get immediate reactions and answers to my questions, I chose to accommodate this request by sending the interview guideline, as their comfort was crucial to both me and the interviews. This was thus another way for me to meet the requests of the participants and ensure that I had created a safe environment, in which the participants could freely express themselves.

All interviews, except from one group interview, were conducted individually. This was an intentional choice based on own experiences from an online fieldwork conducted as an exam during the outbreak of COVID-19 in the spring of 2020⁸. In this specific fieldwork, I experienced how challenging it could be to do online group interviews due to unstable connections creating a fusion of voices that when doing transcriptions was challenging telling apart. In addition, I also experienced how some informants naturally took the floor, which was a product of the internal group dynamic, but this meant that some of the informants barely said anything. I thus chose right from the get-go of this thesis project to conduct all interviews individually. This decision was not only practical in its nature but turned out to have some interesting advantages. It turned out to be a fruitful strategy in gathering knowledge, because this created some in-depth conversations where the floor belonged exclusively to the participants.

Being only one interviewer and one interviewee could potentially have caused silence during the interviews, but this turned out not to be the case. Most participants would fill out this silence by adding more information to the topic being discussed. An interesting outcome of this method of interviewing was that when silence would occur this became a strategical tool in the conversation. Pauses and silence are in general interesting elements in the field of conversations and interviews. In the work *InterView - Learning the Craft of Qualitative Research Interviewing* (2008) Steinar Kvale and Svend Brinkmann emphasize how silence can be used effectively as a type of interview question. In other words, by allowing pauses in the conversation, a potential space for reflection is created for

⁷ This will be outlined and discussed further under the section "Ethical Considerations and Limitations".

⁸ An AU exam: *Keeping your friends close in a time of social distance*

An investigation of online communities among teenagers during the coronavirus.

the interviewee, which often will lead to in-depth answers or food for thoughts (Kvale & Brinkmann 2008, 156). During the interviews I experienced how it was not only the pauses that was fruitful to the interview. Facial expression also served as an important element. With the facial expressions, I could, by lifting the eyebrows in surprise and interest or having them together in concern, express my generate interest and thus encourage the interviewee to elaborate on something or just continue their story without me saying anything. Meaning that during interviews where webcams could not be used due to bad internet connection, I had to be more vocal in my expressions and through this indicating my interest.

Another important tool in my interview strategy, and which in general is a relevant grip when it comes to the art of interviewing, is the technique of 'probing'. Probing is a way to "[...] stimulate a respondent to produce more information, without injecting yourself so much into the interaction [...]" and can be done in many ways (Bernard 1994, 161). The probing techniques most used in my field interviews are the 'echo probe' which is a way of repeating what has just been said and inviting the person to continue. This is a way of emphasizing that you listen and are interested. The other probe is called the 'Uh-huh probe' and is a way of making affirmative sounds such as "right" or "uh-huh" signaling an interest and thus encouraging the interviewee to continue talking (Bernard 1994, 162). These techniques are pivotal when doing face-to-face interviews in real life, but I found that the same techniques for establishing a great contact with the interviewee were crucial too in the online format. I quickly experienced how these probing techniques as well as the use of silence became very fruitful during the interview. I will even argue that to some extent these techniques are even more critical in the online interview where the communication is mediated and easily overlooked or misunderstood by the veil of the internet (James & Busher 2012, 181). All in all, the format of the online interview proved to have more advantages than disadvantages for the outcome of the collected material.

3.1.3 Analytical Approach

The analytical strategy for processing the material collected from the mixed methods consist of a 'content analysis', which "[...] involves coding samples of interview or focus group transcripts, documents and communication records with the aim of systematically identifying categories, themes and patterns and reporting these numerically or graphically." (Sovacool et al. 2018, 30). In its definition and approach, the content analysis is reminiscent of other analytical approaches, such as 'thematic analysis' or 'frame analysis', which also focus on identifying patterns, key issues and

themes (Attride-Stirling 2001, 387). Key features of the content analysis are that it allows the material to be explored and speak for itself, but in a structured way guided by the content of the material. Furthermore, the analytical focus on patterns and key themes fits well with the format of the semi-structured interview, which is, as mentioned earlier, often guided by specific themes or categories (Bernard 1994, 158). According to Sovacool et. al. (2018), content analysis is also a useful analytical approach, when one has "[...] a clear theoretical framework or set of expected categories" beforehand, which is the case for this thesis project (Sovacool et al. 2018, 30). This analytical approach guided both the conducted interviews, field observations and gathering of various project documents and reports. The findings have further been analyzed and discussed in an interaction with the outlined theoretical framework.

Transcribing the interviews was a big part of the process of gathering material from the participants. To begin with, the methodological strategy for transcribing the interviews consisted of a full-length and verbatim transcript, to be able to identify key points and recognize patterns in the following interviews. The first interviews were transcribed in their full length, whereas the remaining interviews were transcribed more generally with a focus on only transcribing significant passages in detail. These passages were either central to the key issues or themes or they broke with the initial identified patterns and points. The content analysis has also been used as an analytical tool in the process of transcribing.

Transcribing interviews is not an uncomplicated process, as it is not only a process of writing down the interview, but also a process of interpretation (Kvale & Brinkmann 2008, 199). A critical stand was taken in regard to the transcription as well as the coding of the interviews. One thing I particularly had to be critical and aware of was the language in which the interviews were conducted in. All interviews were conducted in English except for one in Danish. However, only two of the participants had English as their main language, which meant that the majority of the participants had Tagalog (Filipino) as their main language. Naturally, this created a language barrier, as most participants were not conducting the interview in their main language. I was thus aware of the limitations that this may entailed. This was even something that I myself became aware of, as my English at times fell short when I wanted to phrase certain questions in a certain way. Due to the language barrier, some of the responses in the interviews can be characterized by a limitation of the language. An example of this is seen in a case with two participants who did not feel comfortable with being interviewed in English and therefore asked to do it together as well as with a third person who could translate if needed. Hence, I had to adjust the method of interviewing by conducting a group interview instead to meet their request, since I did not want to exclude anyone. This interview consisted therefore of two interviewees and an interpreter, whom I had interviewed previously in a one-on-one interview. This was as such no problem during the interview, but after during the transcription I realized the pitfalls that this contained. Having a third person translating the content of what was supposed to be a first-hand account from the interviewee suddenly became a second-hand account with potential interpreter from outside to ensure the objectivity of translating the parts of the interview that were spoken in Tagalog. However, this was not possible due to ethical and confidentiality obligations of the project. Instead, I relied on the process while being aware of the potential pitfalls. Additionally, I had to be aware of my own possible interpretations of the interviews in the transcribing process.

3.2 Ethical Considerations and Limitations

All interviews were conducted on the basis of guidelines issued by Aarhus University (IT Support AU 2021). Before the interviews, the participants would receive an informative email with an invitation to participate in the thesis project. The email would also contain an attached 'information sheet' describing the project as well as a 'consent form'⁹ ensuring all participants were familiarized with their rights and position within the project. It was in this emphasized that participating in the project was voluntary and that they at all time could withdraw their consent. Both the 'information sheet' and 'consent form' were developed on the basis of guidelines issued by Aarhus University (IT Support AU 2021). Further, in 2020 I undertook a course on fieldwork and ethics as a part of my education in the department of Anthropology at Aarhus University. Following guidelines issued by DIGNITY was also crucial. In this connection, I did a GDPR course and was too in close dialogue with the project manager of 'FTC' to make sure that I did not interfere with the project in a way that would be harmful to the project or people. All interviews were conducted and recorded on the basis of consent among participants.

⁹ See appendix 1

3.2.1 Child Torture – a Highly Sensitive Subject

One of the biggest concerns and reservations to take in relation to the thesis project is that dealing with the issue of child torture and other forms of violence is a highly sensitive subject especially when working in the Philippines. As mentioned in the 'Introduction' of this thesis, the Philippines is to a large extent a highly inflamed political climate. There have been several cases of killings, and arrests of human rights activists have during the last years become a part of the political climate in the Philippines (Human Rights Watch 2021). Especially, the 'Anti-Terrorism Law', put forward by the Philippines government, brought matters to a head when it was signed by President Duterte in July 2020. This practically law "[...] contains overbroad and vague provisions that the government can use to unjustly target critics" and thus targeting especially human rights activists (Human Rights Watch 2021). Therefore, one has to tread carefully, when dealing with human rights issues in the Philippines in order to protect oneself, the work of NGOs and in this case ultimately the children. For the benefit of this thesis project, my collaboration with DIGNITY, Balay, CLRDC and Stairway has meant that I have had access to their firsthand experiences of working in this particular field. This has brought some fruitful discussions and considerations to my process, as I could draw on competent feedback from my colleagues, who either live and work with or in the Philippines and thus know the political climate for better or worse.

In the start-up phase I was confronted with different questions concerning security, safety and ethics. This meant that my original idea of featuring children's voices in the context of torture as the main focus, had to be adjusted early in the process. Particularly one email correspondence with the director and co-founder of Stairway, initiated a range of considerations in relation to the direction of my project as well as my own safety. His concerns were mainly directed at my safety but also to the challenge of getting people to open up and speak about a sensitive topic, which torture against children is, as it is embedded in a highly political discourse in a dim Philippine political climate (Jørgensen 2022, email). Potential complications were thus raised, which I had to consider before continuing the project. This resulted in some interesting talks and reflections with DIGNITY colleagues, which lead me to rethink the thesis project's focus on the voices of the children and yet sticking to my motivation and idea on place and space, but instead with an indirect inclusion of the children. Including the voices of the children directly through interviews and questionaries turned out not to be feasible due to the scope of the thesis project and for safety reasons. When dealing with children one need to address several ethical considerations and aspects in order to do no harm.

Furthermore, the majority of the children involved in the project 'FTC' have experienced severe breaches of trust in their encounters with authorities and adults in general. Hence, most children are usually not open to engage with new people and especially adults whom they do not know and therefore do not trust. Getting the children's point of view would thus have required a great amount of time in the actual field site in order to build trust and thereby gaining access to their stories. The safety of the children was with good reason number one priority to the project. The voices of the children are thus represented through the perspectives and understandings of the various NGOs working with the children on a daily basis. In addition, three of my informants are former street children or marginalized children, who themselves have experienced live in the street of Manila. However, I was aware of the fact that these informants' experiences of life in the street refer to a time between roughly 1990-2000. Yet, I found their voices important and telling, as it turned out that even though much has happened since then, many of the same patterns of violence and survival are still existing. In this way, I managed to bring in different voices from the field, including first-hand experiences from former street children, which became another way for me to involve the children's voices indirectly through the memories of adults.

Additionally, I needed to respect and accommodate the different relationships and activities that the NGOs involved in the project have with the local community and not least authorities at both local and national level. This means that I was highly aware of their ongoing projects with the authorities, as I did not wish to jeopardize these especially in the light of the 'Anti-Terrorism Law', which has meant unjustified arrests, detentions and even killings of human rights activists, including NGOs and CSOs, who try to make a difference (Human Rights Watch 2021). At the same time, the NGOs that I have been working with in this thesis project are well-established NGOs with many years and even decades of experience with being vocal and advocating cases of children's rights. In other words, I placed my full trust in their abilities within the field.

3.2.2 A Dual Position – Being an Insider and an Outsider

When doing qualitative interviews, the subjective position of the interviewer affects the interview situation, which include a risk of bias. This bias is often associated with face-to-face interactions, where there is a risk that the interviewee seeks to give specific answers that he or she believes are desirable (Sovacool et. al. 2018, 29). This was indeed something I came across during the interviews, where I experienced how my informants often, when I in the end thanked them for the interview,

replied that they hoped they had been helpful and that I could use the answers. This made me aware of my appearance during the interviews, where I assured the informants that there were no wrong answers and that I simply wanted to hear their perspective and experiences with the particular themes within the project (Bernard 1994, 160).

A way to accommodate the risk of bias is by being particularly aware of one's own position in the research. In particularly, I had to be aware of my dual role as both an insider and an outsider to the NGO world – an insider due to my past working for the NGOs, that I am collaborating with on this thesis project, as well as an outsider due to my current position as a graduate student working independently. This dual role posed a dilemma in relation to my existing relationship with the interlocutors, as I felt uncomfortable with the thought that I could potentially upset someone with my findings. By having an existing relationship with the interlocutors one can risk that they believe that you are on their site and representing them, since you have a past of working together. Consequently, I had to manage my insider role vis-á-vis the interlocutors and ensure that I made my independence visible and thus did not represent any of the NGOs. Nonetheless, this project is carried out in a collaboration with DIGNITY, which means that I have accommodated common interests while keeping my independence. Therefore, I had to clarify my analytical standpoint and emphasize my role as a student. My role has been to gather material by listening to different voices and analyzing these in order to examine the places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children in Manila. With this project I wish to outline the different voices within the NGO world dealing with torture and other forms of violence against children. Yet, without representing them.

Chapter 4: Analysis

In the following chapter, I will outline and analyze the materials collected in my fieldwork as well as the project reports. My analytical strategy for processing the collected material is, as mentioned earlier, a content analysis in which I have coded the material by identifying and examining key themes and patterns appearing in the material. The chapter is divided into two parts, each part focusing on the different themes identified: "Places and Spaces in the Lives of Marginalized Children", and "Approaching the Children". Sarah Staub

4.1 Places and Spaces in the Lives of Marginalized Children

In the following part, I will analyze and examine how the concepts of place and space appear in the collected material, as this is one of the main themes identified from both the interviews and the project reports. This includes both an attempt to understand places and spaces of marginalized children in Manila as well as how the different NGOs consciously or unconsciously understand and experience these concepts in their work with the children, who have been subjected to torture and other forms of violence. This part of the analysis is particularly comprehensive as it includes several subcategories that together explore and unfold each other. A theme that recurs in just about every interview as well as the reports, is the concepts of 'safe' and 'unsafe' places and spaces. These will be examined and analyzed across the following sections as they are found between themes within the material. Before I unfold this theme, I want to point out that during the interviews, a confusion sometimes arose around the concepts of place and space. When I asked the informants about place and space most of them would say "It depends how you see place", "What do you mean with place?" or "Space is a tricky thing". However, even though most of the informants initially did not know what to say about place and space and how to understand these, they ended up describing and creating their own understanding of the concepts through their work and engagement with the children. This will be elaborated in the following sections.

4.1.1 A Description of Manila through a Child-Centered View

When examining places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines, it is inevitable to include Manila in this context. With 'Manila' I refer to Metro Manila, which consist of 16 cities with a total population around 12 million people. With its urban areas, Manila holds a population of more than 21 million people making Manila a densely populated metropolis (World Population Review 2022). Moreover, Manila houses some of the world's largest slums, such as Tondo as well as the resettlement area Bagong Silang, and is home to some of the most marginalized and poor people in the Philippines (Asian Development Bank Staff 2009, 2). The description of Manila as a city is similar among the interviewed informants. They all share, without exception, a perception of Manila as being a crowded and in many ways a chaotic city, which holds millions of people for good or bad. Based on the interviews, a picture emerges of a city dominated by poverty, inequality, and high crime rates. The same description is reflected in the project report for 'FTC' (DIGNITY 2018, 5). Furthermore, there is a tendency among the informants to use senses to describe the city

where words such as noise pollution, heat and smells dominate the descriptions, which together create a deeper and a sensuous understanding of the setting in Manila in which the children are found in.

Another interesting observation is, that the informant's descriptions of Manila are influenced by an experience and understanding of the city from a child's point of view in the way that all the informants, both NGO employees and the former street children, describe what the city is like to children. This could be due to many things, and it could even be coincidental. Nevertheless, it points to an awareness of place and space in the work with the children as well as the mindset of the NGOs. An example of this, is how one of the social workers from Stairway, talks about 'safe places' of street children in Manila. When describing these places, she uses "I" instead of "them" and somehow puts herself in the position of the children:

"If I am not in a dark place people can report on me to the police or to the barangay. Then I will be brought to the action center, or they will bring me to the barangay center, or they will have to bring me to the police station. So, like strong lights or places very visible to other people – that's not a safe place for me. So, a safe place is a dark place." (SFI B 2022, 2).

This appears several times in her interview, where she says "I" when describing the children's situations, and it thus becomes a way in which she can put herself in the children's place and thereby try to understand their situation better. Further, it indicates that she is deeply familiar with the pathways of the children and their situation in Manila. Others, use "them" to describe the situations of the children, yet having a child-centered focus in their description of the city:

"The real context of Bagong Silang is that children are exposed to violence and abuses in the integration of the family. The children come from communities, where the living conditions may not be the best for the child. [...] Maybe it is noisy or violent. And the most vulnerable and the primary victim of all are children. So, this is the real situation in Bagong Silang." (FTC E 2022, 1).

Here, Manila and particularly Bagong Silang is described through the children's point of view and from their reality. This indicates a child-focused approach among the NGOs, and it serves as a way to understand Manila as a place through the eyes of the children. The narrative becomes an important factor, as it mainly consists of adults' point of views but at the same time somehow manages to hold the experiences of the children. The material consists of two narratives, as I include voices from the

NGO world who bring voices of the children with them as well as voices of former street children, who today are adults working in the NGO sector as child rights advocates. The latter group of people is complex and yet interesting as they represent both aforementioned worlds by drawing on memories and experiences from their lives in the streets as children as well as experiences from their adult lives in the NGO world. With this, they have a certain kind of authority as well as responsibility, as they both possess their current role as NGO employees and at the same time speak from a place that only they as former street children can know. This is also reflected in the material, where these informants manage to bring different voices into their narratives, creating a nuanced understanding of the children's situations.

4.1.2 Places of Children – a Daily Struggle

Marginalized children in the Philippines, and particularly Manila, are often to be found in several places. The following section is focused on places and not spaces, because the coding indicated this separation. As mentioned earlier, most of the informants initially found it difficult to describe places and spaces, as they did not quite know how to understand and use the concepts. Nevertheless, an interesting pattern emerged during the interviews, in which the use of the terms place and space is partly separated and transformative. I aim to emphasize this through a structure in which place and space are separated. Dividing the two concepts into two subcategories is to some extent a bit forced, however, it serves to emphasize an analytical point. This also means that there will be some overlap between the two sections.

With the above-mentioned description of Manila, it is difficult to imagine Manila as a suitable place for children. This is also reflected in how the informants describe the different places and pathways of the children in Manila. Some of the particular places in which marginalized children such as street children are often found are places such as bus terminals, outside stores and fast food chains, in the park between people or between jeepneys¹⁰ in the middle of the traffic (SFI B 2022, 1). These places are characterized by being public places in constant motion of both people and traffic. Furthermore, they are public places as they are visible places in the cityscape. When I asked about these public places, it became clear that this has to do with the fact that these places are largely dominated by money and thus survival:

¹⁰ A bus-like public transportation in the Philippines.

"Children are found in areas where they can actually make money doing many tasks – often doing work that no one else wants to do, also endangering themselves. They will try to do whatever is possible to have something to eat and maybe even a place to sleep." (SFI A 2022, 1).

This quote emphasizes that these places are dominated by a daily struggle for survival. Besides being places with a lot of people, opportunities for food and money, these are also places that are characterized by being 'in between' places. I call them 'in between' places because the children are moving *between* jeepneys in the traffic and *between* people in the parks and malls. Lots of these places are thus dominated by a movement of the children. The children encounter places, but do so in constant motion.

Other places where the children are typically found are tunnels, under bridges, and in the cemetery. These are all public places, but somehow in a hidden way. These places are surrounded by a certain aura, especially the cemetery, which makes people stay away from these places and they thus become small safe havens for the children (SFI A 2022, 3). These are described as places where the children "[...] to some extent feel safe as they are not being visible to others." (SFI B 2022, 2). Yet, safety is almost a utopia in the lives of marginalized children in Manila. One of the former street children expressed in the beginning of an interview, when asked about places and pathways of children in Manila, that "[...] the streets are not safe. There are simply no safe places on the street for children." (SFI R 2022, 1). This statement stuck with me for a very long time and somehow became my point of reference when understanding places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children. His statement points to safety and unsafety as crucial elements in understanding the pathways of the children. Places and spaces are in this way influenced and perhaps even decided upon the question of safety. The material shows that children are constantly found in unsafe places and situations in Manila, as their daily life is a constant struggle.

4.1.3 Finding 'Safe Spaces' – Transforming Place into Space

Generally, the material and the interviews are characterized by a description of Manila as an unsafe place for children. This is illustrated in how the children seek 'safe places' within this chaos and based on the collected material, it becomes clear that Manila is far from a 'safe place' for children. A question as to whether 'safe places' to the children even exists in Manila thus arise. But what it means to have a 'safe place' can be a complex matter especially since I in my material do not have access to this perspective through the eyes of the children. What I do have, however, is the NGO employees' experiences and knowledge as well as the former street children's own memories and experiences, on which to draw. This provides a different and perhaps not a full picture of these places, but nonetheless still a qualified estimate. As it turned out, based on the interviews and project reports, 'safe places' can be and are many things. They exist in different forms. One of the ways in which the children find or create 'safe places' is by being with other children. The children find a security in each other and by having fellow peers around them: "[...] for them this is their safe place – safe place of being themselves and being with friends." (SFI B 2022, 1). With this, safe places are not defined as specific places in which the children feel safe but rather as situations. In this case; children making each other feel safe. One of the other informants, who have experienced life on the street, share the same understanding of safe places: "I felt safe because I was in the gang. I was with other kids." (SFI H 2022, 2). Here, the same pattern emerges where children, and in this case a gang, somehow become safe places to each other.

Another safe place mentioned by several of the informants is NGOs. One of the informants expresses that: "[...] an important place for street children in Manila is a kind of NGO or an organization helping children to be away from the streets." (SFI R 2022, 2). Here, NGOs are described as a place; a place of helping the children and getting them on a new pathway. This somehow becomes a safe place within the unsafe places and situations in Manila dominating the lives of the children. One of the informants used own experiences from the life in Manila and shared that "[...] the safe place in Manila were for me the organization where I grew up" (SFI F 2022, 1). Words such as 'safe places' and 'unsafe places' are used to describe these, as seen in above section, but these places are much more than just a location. Several informants refer to NGOs as safe places, which is quite interesting, because as they describe these places the choice of words changes: "It provides them with a safe space where they are able to express themselves and their emotions." (FTC Y 2022, 6). When the informants describe what these places mean and why they are safe places to the children they thus use the word space instead. In this way, it becomes places providing spaces and it indicates a more abstract understanding of places. That is why I chose to divide the concepts place and space into two subcategories in this analysis, as I wanted to highlight this analytical point. The structure thus reflects the transformation from place into space.

4.2 Approaching the Children

The above analysis has shown that there is a transformation from place to space when talking about safe places of children. Here, the NGOs are in particular an important place that transforms into space as one examines its significance to the children more closely. The informants thus go from talking about place to space. In the following part, I will examine how this takes place. I do this by presenting the NGOs as places and examining how these places are transformed into spaces through their work and engagement with the children. By this I examine the different approaches the NGOs have in their work with the children as well as their work with addressing torture and other forms of violence.

4.2.1 Bahay Pag-Asa as a Place – 'Following The Child' Creating Spaces

'FTC' is, as mentioned at the beginning of the thesis, a joint project between three NGOs. As DIGNITY is located in Denmark, the NGO is not in direct contact with the children in the project. The NGOs Balay and CLRDC, on the other hand, are. These NGOs are located in Manila, but contrary to Stairway, they are not a physical and concrete place in which the children are found. Instead, Balay and CLRDC work with the children through other places. One of the places that they mainly work in is the so-called Bahay Pag-Asas in Manila. These are "[...] 24-hour child-caring institution established, funded and managed by local government units [...]" that serves as an alternative to juvenile detention centers for children in conflict with the law, who are below the age of 18 but above the age of 15 years (Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines 2013, (s)). Bahay Pag-Asa means House of Hope, but unfortunately one really has to look for this. One of the team members of 'FTC', who has much experience with working in these places by visiting and monitoring them, describes them as:

"Bahay Pag-asa means House of Hope, but here there is no hope. It's built with so many iron bars designed and built for prisoners. [...] The children live in a place with iron bars and their food is limited. When we conduct activities we buy food for the children. They look at the children as criminals, so they are not bothered if the children don't eat good food. There are no beds and no pillows. The children sleep on the floor. The children are being avoided in this place." (FTC X 2022, 3).

In this description, Bahay Pag-Asa is far from appearing as a home to these children or as something that gives hope, as the name of the place indicates. On the contrary, this place is described as prisonlike conditions where the children are confined and denied their fundamental rights. Several of the Bahay Pag-Asas has been improved during the last years, but they are still not ideal places for children (FTC X 2022, 4). Furthermore, the children are found in these places without really being seen or heard. This is where the project 'FTC' come into play since the project is an attempt to try to understand the pathways of the children in order to understand the torture and other forms of violence happening. When I asked informants involved in the project about what the title 'Following The Child' means to them and the children they work with, they all replied that it is about having a child-centered approach in which children at risk (CAR) and CICL and their experiences with the law can be addressed in a holistic way. By following the child, an understanding of places and spaces of the children is included in order to understand their experiences (FTC S 2022, 1). And Bahay Pag-Asa is one of these places.

The work of 'FTC' includes among other things different activities and workshops held by CLRDC and Balay. These are facilitated in places such as the Bahay Pag-Asas as well as communities in Bagong Silang. Based on earlier descriptions these might not be places associated with safety. In particular, the community is a place of "[...] high rates of unemployment, poverty, and a high crime rate." (DIGNITY 2018, 5). Bahay Pag-Asa is as well a place with a lack of resources where the children rarely feel safe (FTC X 2022, 3). However, these activities and workshops bring something different to the children:

"I think what our goal with this project is really to capacitate the children, so they will not be involved in crimes again. We manage to give them space to hear them and it's something they don't have, or they don't experience in their families or when they encounter with the authorities – they were not heard. As much as possible we give that space to them. Allowing them to have this space is what matters most to them." (FTC I 2022, 2).

This quote emphasizes how the activities held inside the Bahay Pag-Asa as well as the community become a space in which the children are being heard. On the one hand the children are found in this specific place, Bahay Pag-Asa, and on the other hand the activities held by the 'FTC' team creates spaces of safety, dreams and hopes. It becomes a space allowing children being children even though that the place the children stay in (Bahay Pag-asa) is the complete opposite. An interesting finding is that the informants talk about Bahay Pag-Asa and the community as places of their interventions, but as they describe the activities and workshops, they talk about it as spaces. This will be explored further in the discussion.

4.2.2 Stairway as a Place Creating Spaces

Stairway is geographically located on the island of Mindoro in the Philippines, which is a several hours journey from Manila. Stairway is described by the informants as a very silent place compared to Manila. In many ways, Stairway is far from Manila both geographically and mindset wise. Two of the informants and former street children describe their first encounter with Stairway as a strange contrast to their lives in Manila: "When I first came to Stairway I just wanted to go back to Manila. At Stairway it is so quiet and silent, but in Manila there are disco places and it's noisy" (SFI H 2022, 1). He continues sharing how he overcame the urge for Manila's noisy life and instead indulged in the silence, so to speak: "But Stairway was so persistent – I don't know how they overcame my attitude. Later, it became a safe place for me. I would learn about my rights and my responsibility that come with this." (SFI H 2022, 3). Another says: "It is very different from Manila. It's very silent here and especially at night." (SFI R 2022, 2). Both informants draw on their memories using senses to describe and distinguish Stairway as a place from Manila. Stairway is thus a complete contrast to Manila, which as it turns out is a deliberate choice. In one of the interviews, the co-founder and creative director of Stairway emphasizes the importance of this:

"It's important that what we do – what Stairway do – needs to be away from the concrete jungle and the harshness from the city and we need to slow down you know be still and reflect. Just get in sync and in tune with nature and in doing that we get in touch with ourselves. So, Stairway is different from other places, this idea of space – this vastness – so growing, breathing, expanding, exploring and imagining – all of those are things that can happen when your space, I think, has been broaden and has been widen." (SFI A 2022, 4).

In this quote, the importance of nature as a part of Stairway is emphasized. Nature is almost made into an adjective that describes Stairway as well as a vital function of the place and the work with the children. At the same time, there is this shift from place to space. Stairway thus goes from being this concrete place to being a space that involves much more. As mentioned above, there is this tendency among the informants to describe the NGOs as spaces and this quote becomes an example of this. Another telling example of this is how one of the informants from Stairway uses the word place when talking about Manila. This applies to both safe places and unsafe places for the children. However, this changes during the interview, as a shift occurs when she starts talking about Stairway as a place and what it means to the children in particular the sense of safety. Here the word space is used instead, and Stairway thus becomes more of a space rather than a place: "Stairway is a very artistic place. These are creative expression. We have a lot of ways of helping the children and having them talking about their experiences without fear. All of the activities are in spaces where the children can express themselves." (SFI B 2022, 4).

In this quote she starts mentioning Stairway as a place, but as she describes the role and significance of the place to the children, she changes it to use the word space. This is interesting and speaks directly into previous pattern, where there is this shift from place to space when discussing the role and work of the NGOs.

4.2.3 Children's Rights as a Language

The activities held by Balay and CLRDC in the 'FTC' project as well as Stairway in their work, play a crucial part in their approach to the children. One of the important factors and ways that the NGOs work with the children is through education. In this context education includes both academic skills as well as life skills such as children's rights. In the 'FTC' project, education becomes an empowerment: "[...] it is actually to see them raise from crisis you know a real transformation. And the only way we can do that is through our education sessions." (FTC E 2022, 3). In this sense, education becomes key in the empowerment of the children and letting them find themselves in a chaotic and challenging everyday life in Manila. In addition, it is explained as an important tool, when it comes to the preventive work: "It tries to help the children to have a meaningful education, life skills, and prevent them from entering the juvenile justice system." (FTC E 2022, 2). One of the staff members of Stairway explains the role of education as:

"Children have been exploited throughout time because they are seen as objects [...] It's about education and understanding children as human beings. It's about seeing children as members of society contributing to society. We need to educate everyone. This is everyone all day and every day." (SFI A 2022, 3).

In this sense, education is highlighted as an important children's right; seeing children as members of society and contributing to society is only possible if society listens to the children and respect their voices to be heard. Common to most of the activities is that they are focused on awareness of children's rights. Through the activities the children gain an insight and an awareness of the rights they have. A team member from the 'FTC' project shares how human rights, or more specifically children's rights, become a tool and an approach in their work with the children:

"For this project one of the modules is human rights, education and visioning and I think they included some of the rights of the children, so in this discussion it was mentioned with torture and ill-treatment, and I think from there, the team was able to illustrate and elaborate in a manner understood by the children in the detention facility" (FTC O 2022, 2).

This quote illustrates how human rights are key in the work with the children. They somehow become a language opening up to the horrible experiences of the children. In this sense, they become a way of illustrating the violence and allowing the children to put words into something almost unspeakable. By having human rights as a point of reference, children become aware of their past experiences and how their rights were violated (FTC Activity Report June 2021, 2). This means that through these activities the children become aware of the violations that they have encountered in their pathways. In other words, the activities focused on human rights become a language in which the NGOs manage to reach out and approach the children and their needs. With this, the language creates a space in which the children can express their past. However, there is also a risk that the NGOs impose a language of human rights, which the children cannot identify with. This will be discussed later in the discussion.

4.2.4 Approaching the Children through Trust and Time

Creating a language around the unspeakable is an important part of the NGOs' work with the children. As indicated in above analysis, human rights are a part of dealing with the issue of torture and other forms of violence in a way that the children create a language where they become aware of their past as well as feel comfortable in sharing this. The NGOs have different tools and approaches when addressing the children's past experiences of torture and other forms of violence. These will be discussed further in the discussion. Still, they have a common denominator. The material indicates that all the activities discussed by my informants are designed to gain the trust of the children. This is seen in the project of 'FTC': "In the Bahay Pag-asa all our activities are designed to get their trust and comfortable feelings at the children." (FTC X 2022, 3). When I asked my informants, who work directly with the children, if it is difficult to gain the trust from the children or how they would gain the trust, their answers somehow circled around the same elements namely trust and time.

An important approach mentioned by both the 'FTC' team as well as the staff at Stairway, is to approach the children as children rather than clients. Social workers across the NGOs emphasize this. The following quote is from a social worker at Stairway, who shares how she approaches the children:

"Another thing, treat them as family. Don't treat them as a client but as family. I treat them as my child, my good friend and as my son. If you show this kind of feelings to the child, the child will think that he is important and accepted, which will make the child feel loved and valued. [...] It takes time and trust. They need to understand that you are there to help." (SFI B 2022, 3).

In this quote, there are several elements that are essential to highlight. First of all, the importance of treating the child with love and respect like a family member. Secondly, words such as time and trust are crucial in this process. It indicates the enormous patience and inclusiveness that the NGOs must possess. It also indicates the importance of creating a space in which the child feels this trust. This is also reflected in the 'FTC' project, where the informants explain the importance of the exact same approach:

"Beside from giving them training and capacity building we also build first their trust. We have this one and-one conversation with them -I treat them not just as a partner or a client, but I treat those children as my own child or as my friend, so they will feel that they are safe." (FTC Y 2022, 2).

This quote goes in line with the same approaches of the Stairway team, where a sense of family is created. However, due to past experiences "often the children are not sure who to trust [...]" (FTC O 2022, 2). In this sense, trust and time are proven to be crucial keywords in the work with the children. Based on the project reports and interviews, it becomes clear that it is easier said than done to build the trust from the children. It requires patience from the NGOs and an approach to the children that manage to create a language around an issue that in many ways are difficult for the children to articulate.

4.3 Summary of Key Findings

The main themes identified in the collected material circles around the understanding and experience of places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children as well as how the NGOs approach the children they work with. A cross-cutting theme, which recurs throughout the material, is the notion of 'safe' and 'unsafe' places and spaces. All informants describe places in the lives of marginalized children in Manila as a daily struggle and as a question of survival. In addition, these places are characterized by a movement of the children in and out and in-between places. Overall, there are two types of public places described by the informants; one is a visible place, crowded with people and traffic in which the children can make a living. The other are more hidden public places that becomes a way for the children to hide from the people and encounters of the former places.

Safety is proven to be an important factor in understanding places and spaces in the lives of the children as well as the way NGOs approach and work with the children. The informants point towards two main safe places for the children. These are the children themselves being safe places to each other and NGOs being safe places. An important finding in this relation is that, as these places are described, a shift in the choice of words occur. In this way, there is a transformation of places into spaces. This becomes clear through the examples of activities and workshops held by the NGOs, in which children's rights also play a crucial part in the way the NGOs approach the children and their past. Human rights somehow become a language in which the children can express their past experiences as well as a way for the NGOs to understand the situation of the children.

Chapter 5: Discussion

Based on the above analysis and findings, the following chapter discusses how the different NGOs understand, experience and utilize the concepts of place and space in their work with marginalized children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence. I do this by drawing on the theory of place and space, outlined in chapter two, to investigate how these theories can provide other and perhaps new insights and understandings of how the NGOs work with the children. Furthermore, I will include elements from the debate in the literature review, which is also outlined in chapter two. The following chapter is divided into three parts. First part focuses on children 'in-between' places, second part explores and discusses safe spaces in the lives of the children, and the third part focuses on how the NGOs address torture and other forms of violence.

5.1 Children in-between Places in Everyday of Violence

In the following part, I will discuss how places and spaces in the lives of the children can be explored through the notion of being 'out-of-place' presented by Cresswell (1996) as well as a more dynamic understanding of the concepts based on both Tuan (1977) and Certeau (1984). As presented in the analytical findings, marginalized children are found in many places, such as between traffic and people as well as in the streets and outside their homes. In this sense, they are perhaps not belonging to one particular place but rather several places. In the analysis, I called these places, that are often

characterized by a constant motion of the children, in-between places. I want to explore and discuss the terms of being in-between places and Cresswell's 'out-of-place', as the children seem to be both in-between places as well as 'out-of-place'.

5.1.1 Places of an Everyday Violence

Places in the lives of the children become complex with the idea of the in-between. The collected material, project reports as well as the literature point towards the fact that we do not necessarily know much about what happens to the children in the different places. One of the informants working on the project 'FTC' expressed how this is actually a challenge, when working with the children:

"[...] we are focusing on the community and Bahay Pag-Asa and there is stuff happening along the way and that is the pathway and that is a bit blurred. What happens to the child between the moment at which the child is taken into custody by the police in Bagong Silang until the time the child arrives to the Bahay Pag-Asa? We know of course, where that child is – in the hands of the police – but it's almost inaccessible to us. It's a bit of a challenge." (FTC S 2022, 6).

This quote is interesting because it indicates a gap of knowledge in regard to places in the lives of marginalized children. The NGOs working in the field have an idea of these places, but particularly what happens in the in-between places are to a high extent blurred and unknown. Furthermore, it emphasizes the complexity and challenges of this gap, as it is both difficult to get access to these places physically, but also to get access to the children's experiences through their thoughts and own stories. These are somehow places created by an interaction between the children and the city. This will be discussed in the following paragraph. The project 'FTC' attempts to examine and understand the pathways of the children, but as the project has proceeded, and as the quote also indicates, this has turned out to be a bigger challenge than estimated. However, the project does know that these places are most likely places of torture and other forms of violence, and thus violations of human rights.

As shown in the analysis, the children are mostly found in two types of public places; one is visible and characterized by a constant movement, where the other public places are more hidden and an attempt for the children to create safety. The former places are characterized by being public places, in which children encounter different people in their daily struggle for survival. Based on the interviews and project reports, these are often encounters of violence. Two of the informants, who are former street children, shared in their interviews, how certain places such as in front of stores, fast food chains, and malls, are places where you, as a street child are met with violence: "There are people working in these places, like a security guard and they will hurt and hit the kids who are begging" (SFI R 2022, 3). This statement points to a larger issue that is expressed by several of the informants; violence is a part of the city's DNA, and a part of survival, meaning that many children know nothing else. This DNA also has to do with the living conditions in places such as Bagong Silang, where poverty becomes a driving force for violence:

"There is this kind of normalization of violence. These are kids who are basically from you know the bottom of society I mean even in Bagong Silang I think they are amongst the most marginalized groups. [...] They come from extremely poor families; these kids are probably forced to work for a living from an early age and of course perhaps don't have access to school because they have to help feed the family. So, these are kids that are used to a very rough life from the very start and a part of that is that they are exposed to violence from a very very early age – family violence, violence from their peers, violence from the community." (FTC S 2022, 3).

This quote by one of the team members of 'FTC' indicates the importance of understanding places of the children in relation to violence. It emphasizes how certain places in Manila are dominated and perhaps even defined by an everyday violence. When I asked one of the informants, who himself has lived on the streets, if violence was a part of survival, he simply answered: "Violence is just a part of living" (SFI H 2022, 2). Violence is thus inevitable in these places and encounters, and it is more than just a matter of survival, as it is a part of living. This is underlined by the above description of Bagong Silang and the living conditions in general to which the children are subjected to.

Based on this, I argue that particular the 'out-side' and the in-between places are dominated by a high risk of violence, as these places are characterized by an encounter with people and potential perpetrators of the children. Furthermore, they are places characterized by certain patterns, characteristics, and movements indicating that the children are found in places dominated by a daily struggle for survival. The material even suggests that the movements of the children are characterized by this exact struggle meaning the places in the lives of the children become places of struggle. The struggle that the in-between places hold becomes a way of understanding the everyday violence and thus the torture and other forms of violence happening to the children. Conversely, the everyday violence also become a way of describing the pathways and movements of the children.

5.1.2 In-between Places – a Dynamic Place

The in-between places are interesting because they are not necessarily concrete places, since they are proven to be places of motion. In this sense they are places in process and thus more abstract, as they are constantly made and remade in the motion of the children, including their encounters with different people and everyday violence. This resonates with Certeau and his understanding of place and space, which allows a more dynamic understanding of the concepts. As mentioned earlier, according to Certeau, place is concrete, and space is dynamic. To Certeau "[...] space is a practiced place" and place is thus dynamic, as it is transformable in the way it is practiced (Certeau 1988, 117). In other words, place become dynamic by the practice of it and with this it makes more sense to talk about spaces instead of places. With this understanding, the in-between places can instead be understood as spaces, since they are dynamic places in a constant movement, which are practiced by the children and the people they encounter through these places (Certeau 1988, 117).

As shown above, the in-between places are often dominated by an encounter with various forms of violence and unsafety for the children. Yet, since these places are also shown to be places where the children can get money and food, they are also important places to the children. Thus, it seems rather conscious that the children are found in these in-between places. In this way, it can be argued that it becomes a part of the children's survival that they prefer to move between places. Another way to understand it is by seeing this as liminal places and periods in the children's lives. The anthropologist Victor Turner has in his work concerned himself with this notion of liminality. In his work The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual (1967) he puts forward a theory on the liminal period. Based on Arnold Van Gennep's three steps of 'Rites de Passage' (1909), he defines the liminal period as something being in-between. Hence, Turner's theory about the liminal period is also about being inbetween (Turner 1967, 93). By applying Turner's notion of liminality, to the lives of the children, it becomes visible how the children are actually in-between places in several ways. One way is that the children are in-between places in a dynamic sense, as they make and remake places in their constant motion. Another way is that children are in-between places by simply being children. The children are not adults, but due to their struggle for survival they are forced to behave like adults. In this way, the children are found in a liminal period, to use the concept of Turner. However, this can be understood as more than just a liminal period, as the children are in liminal places both through their movements and behavior. They manifest themselves in their role on several levels.

Since these places are made and remade in the interaction between the children and the people of encounter, it makes it difficult for NGOs to approach these. Drawing on Certeau, this thesis argues that the in-between places, with their dynamics and negotiations, are produced in the encounter between the children and potential perpetrators. Based on Certeau's dynamic approach to place and space as well as Turner's liminal period, I argue that by understanding the in-between places as spaces, they become more accessible for NGOs to work in. With this, the in-between place has the potential of being made and remade for the better, in which the in-between places are experienced as open and negotiable allowing the place to be "reimagined" and thus holding another experience (Cresswell 2015, 71).

A counter-argument to this is to ask if it really makes sense that just because one tries to perceive this as spaces instead of places, it provides new opportunities. Yet, I believe that there lies a potential in Certeau's dynamic approach to place and space. By drawing on Certeau as well as Cresswell in the understanding of in-between places, we get a more open understanding of these. With this, it is no longer concrete places as such, but rather changeable places; they become what Certeau calls a practiced place (Certeau 1988, 117). By approaching the in-between places and its everyday violence with the theoretical lens of Certeau, it allows an understanding of these as not fixed places, but rather places that can change according to different activities and how the place is practiced. In other words, how the place is exercised can create new spaces with new opportunities. The argument is accordingly that by having a practiced place, where NGOs can create activities and thus new spaces for the children, perhaps one can try to combat the everyday violence. Furthermore, since these places are both liminal and dynamic, it allows the NGOs to enter the in-between places with a more practical approach in which activities and workshops can create spaces and make places more safe for the children. This is a potential that the NGOs engage in. By seeing the in-between places as spaces, it becomes more visible, and thus allow the NGOs to work in these and creating spaces in which the children can feel safe.

5.1.3 Being Out-of-Place

The concept of being 'out-of-place' presented by Cresswell (1996) is, as mentioned earlier in chapter two, about how people and things are placed and perceived in the world, and how this is socially constructed. Some things are 'in-place' if they occur in certain places that are socially accepted, and other things are 'out-of-place' if they are found in not expected places (Cresswell 1996, 9). Cresswell

describes this as "[...] a sense of proper" referring to something or someone belonging to certain places; places that we in society have decided are proper places for these things or people (Cresswell 1996, 3). In an example, he includes homelessness and how society treats homelessness. Homeless people are often seen as people being out-of-place or without a place of belonging (Cresswell 1996, 5). I find this aspect of people being in-place and out-of-place interesting in the context of both the position and situation of the marginalized children described in the analysis.

The notion of being out-of-place resonates in many ways with the lives of the children, examined in the analysis, who are often found in many places not belonging to one particular place and thus to use the term of Cresswell, in some sense being out-of-place. In this way, it also becomes a question of belonging. When children are found in the streets they are found in-between places and perhaps even out-of-place, as their pathway are dominated by a constant motion not belonging to certain places (SFI B 2022, 2). Yet, based on the interviews it becomes clear how this sense of belongingness is crucial in not only the lives of the children but also in the work with the children. Even when the children re-enter the community after their time in the Bahay Pag-Asas, they often feel out-of-place:

"[...] when they return to their community and the people there know that they have been in detention – sometimes it happens that for example [if] the child was detained for theft or robbery, and he returns to the community – if another robbery happens everyone will think it's him – assuming it's the same child. They are not given the child the chance to live a normal life. So, it's not safe. Also, the violence that comes with it – the child is at risk of violence not only from the people but also the authorities." (FTC O 2022, 5).

This quote indicates an understanding of the children as people who has a particular difficulty in adjusting to society when re-entering after their time in the Bahay Pag-Asas. It also indicates that children lack a sense of belonging in the community when they return. However, the children want to belong to somewhere or to someone. In some cases, the children are seeking the same sense of belonging among peers. This is when the children are found outside their homes in the streets or in the community; places that following Cresswell are out-of-place (Cresswell 1996, 5). In many cases, the children come from broken families, and they would then escape their homes to create a sense of belonging elsewhere (FTC Y 2022, 3). These become examples of how children are creating safe spaces and a sense of belonging together.

A general theme that occurs in the material is, how the children miss a sense of belonging and also in many cases their families (FTC Activity Report June 2021, 4). Based on the activity reports from the 'FTC' project it becomes clear how the activities held in the Bahay Pag-Asa are designed to create a sense of belongingness and connectedness among the children. The activities held by the NGOs inside the Bahay Pag-Asas create a sense of belonging making sure that the children do not feel alone. This is also in line with Stairway's work with the children, as they also try to establish a sense of belonging. One of the informants expresses Stairway as: "[...] it's a very different place, where I felt that I belong." (SFI R 2022, 3). These are cases of how the NGOs try to create an alternative to the out-of-place by creating a sense of belonging in their work with the children. These activities provide a "[...] safe space where the children can actually express themselves [...]" (FTC I 2022, 2). These are thus described as safe spaces. With the above examples, this thesis argues that belongingness can be understood as a space, and that this is also how the NGOs work with the sense of belonging.

5.2 "We are Safe Spaces"

As shown in the analysis, there is a transformation of place into space in the role of NGOs and their work with the children. I find this space particularly interesting, as it is referred to by several of the informants as safe spaces. In the following section, I will explore these spaces further and discuss how the different NGOs utilize these in their work with the children. I do this by drawing on findings from the analysis focusing on these spaces created by the NGOs. In addition, I include theoretical elements creating a framework for a discussion of the above.

5.2.1 NGOs Going Beyond Places

Based on the findings presented in the analysis, many of the children come from places in Manila that are dominated by an everyday violence and survival. In Manila, *place* is shown to be a question of power and survival, as the children are often found in places where they can either make money or get food. These places are, as shown earlier in this discussion, characterized by encounters of people and violence. In this sense, most of the children come from places dominated by a hierarchy, which have an underlying power structure to it (SFI A 2022, 6). The children are vulnerable and found at the bottom of this hierarchy created by an everyday violence. This hierarchy is deeply embedded in the children's behaviour but based on the material it is indicated that the NGOs actively tries to break with these structures. Stairway works consciously with this transformation:

"So, where the kids come from space is a hierarchy – the kids are supposed to be in certain places [...] In Stairway we try not to create angle places – many things are natural and curved spaces. These are important places. It's about using this kind of space to create equality and balance." (SFI A 2022, 6).

In this, the architecture of Stairway comes to play a crucial part in the use of transforming Manila's hierarchical places of survival into spaces accommodating the children. The physical place is constructed in a way that allows an unfolding of spaces dominated by equality and balance. Drawing on Certeau and his dynamic understanding of place, these transformations of places, both in the case with 'FTC' and Stairway, are examples of spaces created in the "practiced place" (Certeau 1988, 117). It can thus be argued that by exercising the place in a different and more child-friendly way, the NGOs manage to create spaces. Another example is reflected in one of the project reports from the 'FTC' project:

"One of them said that he was happy because we visited them, gave them food to eat, prepared games, talked to them, and helped them express their true feelings, which gave them hope to continue dreaming and achieving their goals in life when they left Bahay Pag-Asa." (FTC Activity Report May 2021, 4).

This is an example of how the 'FTC' team manage to go beyond the place of Bahay Pag-Asa. The activities held by the team transform the place into a space approaching the children at their level and needs. In this transformation there are no hierarchies that set boundaries for the children because the work of the NGOs extends beyond these places dominated by these violent structures. I therefore argue that the presence of the NGOs in itself help creating a different space for the children; a space in which the children are taken into consideration.

5.2.2 Spaces Allowing Children to be Children

As shown throughout the analysis and discussion, both the 'FTC' team and Stairway work with marginalized children in different places, and some of them more specific than others. Balay and CLRDC work mainly inside the Bahay Pag-Asa and therefore making this a specific place of their work with the children. Likewise, Stairway works inside the place of Stairway and thus creating a setting for their work with the children. However, as shown above, their work goes beyond these places. In the analysis, these spaces are mentioned as places transformed into spaces through different activities and workshops held by the NGOs. The activities and workshops are partial different among

the 'FTC' team and the work of Stairway and yet there is an overlap with a common denominator of creating safe spaces which let children be children.

Stairway uses theater, as a way to both approach the children and work with them. An important place in Stairway that I want to highlight, as it is described as a safe space, is the stage. The stage is mentioned as something quite special by all five informants and employees of Stairway:

"[...] a place at Stairway that is very important to the children is the stage, because it's the heart of Stairway where people or children can be able to share their stories confidently without being ashamed because they feel that it's a very safe place that they can trust and a place that listens to them. It's a place that will not judge them for who they are but accept them for the experience that they have. For me the stage is also a safe place in Stairway." (SFI F 2022, 2).

This quote is interesting in more levels. In this, she describes the stage as a safe place that the children can trust, because it is a place that listens to them. In this way, the stage becomes almost humanized with an ability of listening. This is interesting, as it gives another layer to place as a concept. She describes the stage as a place, but one that has the ability to accommodate the children. As I asked her to elaborate this, she changed her choice of word:

"It's the space at Stairway that I first discovered my talent, but it's also the space it kind of like helped me to realized that I have been abused and it's okay to accept it and share it with people. That it's why I love being on the stage and just being there gives me a feeling of being safe all the time or being trusted and being confident with who I am and accepting myself." (SFI F 2022, 2).

It is interesting how she starts calling the stage a place at Stairway, but when elaborating why this particular place is important to her, she changes it and calls it space instead. It is an interesting place because it appears to be more than just a place. Another informant has similar experience of the stage:

"It's magic. It's therapy without knowing. The stage is a comfort to me [silence] it was where I felt a trust. I can do whatever I want and express myself – you can sing, laugh and shout. You can express yourself freely. That's the thing that kids need to do – something inside them need to be burst. Theater is a good way of letting those feelings out." (SFI H 2022, 3).

There is much to take from this quote, as it holds many elements in describing the stage as a place and how this specific place is transformed into a space. Focus on this transformation is the ability to express oneself freely as a child in a place of trust. By drawing on Tuan and his definition of place and space, the stage becomes a place of significance. According to Tuan, place has a meaning, which he calls 'pauses', which is what creates a sense of being in the world (Cresswell 2015, 35). With this understanding, the stage is 'pause' and thus becomes a way of being in the world. This goes in line with how the stage is described as a place of free expression. In addition, there is something interesting in the figurative way in which he describes that there is something inside the children that need to be burst and let out. The stage becomes an outlet for the children, and a way for them to be in the world. Yet, based on both informants descriptions of the stage, it is both a place as well as a space. By seeing the stage as a dynamic place that through activities and emotional expressions, has the ability to become something else and drawing on Certeau the stage becomes space. In other words, the stage is a practiced place, and thus a space (Certeau 1988, 117). Yet, it is also a way of being in the world and thus a place of significance.

Games and dance are another way through which the NGOs try to create spaces for the children. The 'FTC' team in particular uses these approaches in their work with the children. Drawing on the different activity reports from the 'FTC' project and with the interviews as support, it is clarified how the various activities held inside the Bahay Pag-Asa create spaces in which the children can explore new things: "The games that were given to the children, helped them enhance their talents especially in dancing, also cooperation with the team to achieve one goal. It also helped them conquer their shyness and gain self-confidence particularly in sharing their stories." (FTC Activity Report May 2021, 2). In one way, dance and games become a way for the children to gain self-confidence, leading them to express their feelings and stories. In this way, it also becomes a way for the 'FTC' team to create a sense of trust, as the activities of games and dance thus becomes a safe space letting the children express themselves. In addition, it becomes spaces that allows the children "[...] to experience what a normal childhood is, as it has been robbed from them." (FTC O 2022, 4). This indicates the power of the activities, in which the 'FTC' team sees the children as children rather than clients or criminals. Thus, the activities both have several functions, both creating trust among the children as well as transforming a potential unsafe place, which the Bahay Pag-Asa can be experienced as, into a safe space. With this, places are argued to create a setting for spaces to be explored. In other words, it become places providing spaces.

5.2.3 People as Spaces

At this point it has become clear how spaces are created through activities and approaches by the NGOs. Creating safe spaces for the children has proven to be an important part of the different NGOs' work. Generally, there is an awareness of place and space in the work of NGOs, which manifest itself through the child-centered focus as well as the approaches the NGOs take, when working with the children. The outcome of the activities creates new opportunities for the children: "Having these activities bring back the lost self-confidence. [...] Realizing that they can still be a help to other people." (FTC Y/I 2022, 1). With these new opportunities, new spaces are created, in which the children can express themselves freely. Hence, a common picture emerges of the importance of having child friendly spaces.

In the analysis it was explored how the children find safety in other children and the NGOs working with them. Based on the material these are described as safe places in the analysis. According to Tuan, place is defined as something with meaning. Based on this assumption, he argues that a mother can be a place to a child, and with this he indicates that people can too be considered as places (Tuan 2018, 29). Tuan even takes this further and argues that children are 'placeless' without the place of the mother (Tuan 2018, 29). This resonates to some extent with previous argument of children being in-between places and out-of-place, and thus not necessarily having the safety of a family. I now wish to take this argument further by applying Certeau's dynamic understanding of place and space, since people are not static but rather mobile and dynamic. With this I argue that if people are considered places, as in accordance with Tuan, they can as well be considered as spaces, when drawing on Certeau's dynamic understanding. This is interesting in regard to my fieldwork, where it is indicated that the NGOs act as not only safe places, as presented in the analysis, but also safe spaces to the children. In one of the interviews, an informant from the 'FTC' project were telling me about how they, in the project, approach the children and how to gain their trust, and after a short pause for thought she said: "I think they see us as safe spaces." (FTC O 2022, 2). This is interesting, as it suggests that the places transformed into spaces, which the NGOs have proven to be, also includes people. This opens up for a new understanding of safe spaces, as this space is expanded. Through the activities, the staff become visible and play a crucial part in the lives of the children. The activities create safe spaces for the children, but the staff also become safe spaces. With this, it is indicated that safe spaces can be more than just places transformed into spaces, but also include people through the projects. On the contrary, it can be argued that although the aim of the NGOs is to create safe spaces

for the children, having a safe space is a complex matter. This is also supported by the analysis, which shows how challenging it is for the children to find safe spaces as well as the different forms they exist in. Hence, to fully understand safe spaces for the children require the children's own notions of safe spaces. All this taken into account, and based on above discussion, this thesis argues that the whole project 'FTC' as well as the activities of Stairway are oriented towards creating safe spaces to the children. At the same time, these places become a way of being in the world (Cresswell 2015, 35).

5.3 Approaching the Unspeakable – NGOs Creating Spaces

Creating a language around torture and other forms of violence can be difficult when working with children. The activities and the spaces the NGOs create seem to be part of the answer. In the analysis, it has been shown that the NGOs consciously use certain techniques and even languages to approach the children and the human rights violations they encounter. Examples of activities creating awareness and knowledge of children's rights consequently dominate the material. I now wish to explore this and discuss how the NGOs work with creating a language around something unspeakable and to a large extent something hidden.

5.3.1 Creating a Language without Words

The use of art as an activity occurs in both the work of the 'FTC' project and Stairway. This is described as a way of both approaching and helping the children to process their past experiences on their own terms:

"Then there is art where they can grow – they can draw if they get mad, if they want to call on the person that have abused them – they can draw this. They can draw all their emotions and then afterwards processing who they are [...] But the staff also need to be comfortable by talking about the abuses [...]" (SFI B 2022, 5).

Art becomes a way for the children to put words into something they might not know how to put words into, as they either do not have a vocabulary for this or they are afraid to share their story due to stigma from society as well as the political climate. An informant from Stairway expresses this as an effective way for the children to express themselves: "It's a way or a tool for the children to say what they feel through these things. It's also a way of keeping a distance by sharing but still not telling all of it." (SFI F 2022, 3). Art thus becomes a way for the children to say things without really saying it with words as well as still keeping a distance if needed. This is yet another example of how the

NGOs create spaces for the children to express themselves and process their past experiences of violations. At the same time, it is emphasized how it is crucial to have people around the children who are able and willing to listen to the children and process their traumas. In this way, the staff also becomes safe spaces for the children.

The project of 'FTC' uses similar techniques to approaching traumas of the children, which in most cases focus on torture and other forms of violence. Here, colorful materials and illustrations are used in the activities to include all children as well as embracing the illiterate children:

"[...] some of the children, even though they are maybe almost 17, they don't even know how to write their name. And imagine children who are undergoing cases, how will they be able to understand what is going on and sometimes they have to write and sign their names. So, we try our best to include everyone in our activities by providing all of these alternatives." (FTC O 2022, 2).

With this, the children can draw their feelings or how they felt during cases of torture and other forms of violence. As the above example from Stairway, art becomes a communication tool for the children to express their feelings and incidents from their past, which they may find difficult to express. Another way, that the unspeakable becomes less unspeakable, is through games. In previous section, it was discussed how games and playing for the children is a part of creating safe spaces for the children. These safe spaces of games and playing also becomes a language: "We also conduct the activities so children will not feel traumatized by sharing their stories. Especially in documenting cases of torture – we use drawings of different kinds of torture and the children would then stand in lines." (FTC X 2022, 4). This means that the games and activities are not only providing safe spaces for the children can actually articulate their past. This also means that the NGOs have to know how to translate these expressions of the children into the children's situations and realities. In this sense, art creates a space for a language and trust.

In the analysis, it was shown how human rights are used as a language for the NGOs to approach the children, and for the children to become aware of their rights. One of the ways, that human rights are used in a more creative manner, is through small animation films created by Stairway. These are three animations that promote children's rights, as well as address and aim to prevent child sexual abuse and exploitation (Stairway Animation Film Toolkit 2022). The use of animations, as a help for the

children to share their story, is brought up by most of the informants of Stairway: "I think it's a great help for the children to express themselves [...] It becomes a way to discuss these issues also." (SFI H 2022, 4). With this it becomes a way for Stairway to create a language around an issue that many children find difficult or are ashamed to approach and put into words (SFI F 2022, 2). The animations create a space in which the children can express themselves and disclose past experiences without saying much. Thus, human rights become a wordless language creating a safety for the children. Additionally, the animations become a way of discussing the issue of child sexual abuse and exploitation, and thus shedding light on this practice and creating an awareness. The animations and the other activities discussed in this section, become tools and approaches for the NGOs to work around and with the children, but to the children, the activities become a language and a safe space.

5.3.2 Human Rights as a Discourse

As emphasized both in the literature review as well as the analysis, torture and other forms of violence against children are often concealed in a larger practice of everyday violence. The above section discusses how the NGOs talk about torture and other forms of violence with the children as well as how they address this alarming issue. An interesting debate in this regard is whether it matters how we label it. The NGOs that I have interviewed all use different labels around these practices. Moreover, the NGOs also work with different focuses, which is also reflected in their labeling and language around the issues. The 'FTC' team including DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC use terms such as torture and violence referring to "[...] violence that is committed towards them by figures of authorities" (FTC S 2022, 4). On the other hand, the Stairway staff use terms such as abuse, exploitation and violence to address the cases they work with. In this way, the NGOs have different ways of labeling the violations the children encounter.

In an interview one of the informants from Stairway, expressed how the "[...] children on the street and in the centers live with torture in different ways." (SFI B 2022, 5). When I asked her to elaborate on what she meant with the term torture, she said: "It's eating bad food, sleeping on the floor, being locked inside rooms, abuse by other children and children living in the centers for many years without an identity. For me torture is many things [...]. It's like abuse – there are many forms of abuse." (SFI B 2022, 5). In this, she talks about torture, but in a different way, compared to the 'FTC' team, where she compares it with abuse, as this is the language that she is familiar with. But distinguishing these forms of violations against children is also tricky, as shown in the literature review (BaagøRasmussen 2012, 26). The literature indicated that most of the violations against children, including torture and abuse, are disguised in an everyday violence dominating the places and spaces in the lives of the children:

"We say torture and other forms of violence. We don't want to kind of box it in because there are many different types of violence that these children are exposed to. And there is no ranking of that. If it's harming the child physically or mentally then it's a relevance to us and it's something that we need to combat. So, of course the project doesn't deal with let's say you know child abuse, sexual abuse [...] This is not a part of this project, so we are dealing with violence that is done by someone in an official compacity. But of course, it is all related in the end and it is difficult to kind of distinguish and separate them, because it is simply such a big part of life in a place as Bagong Silang." (FTC S 2022, 4).

Here, the informant from the 'FTC' addresses the challenge of how the NGO world articulate and work around torture and other forms of violence against children. The NGOs thus use different labeling when addressing the different crimes committed against children, but one language they have in common is a language around human rights. This is emphasized in how children's rights and stories are always worth listening to and fighting for, which the activities held by both the 'FTC' team and Stairway aim to do.

Consequently, there is a certain understanding among the NGOs based on human rights. Human rights therefore become a common language in the way the NGOs approach the unspeakable. Based on the interviews and project reports, the discourse of human rights serves as a way of helping to strengthen the children and creating awareness, and in this way it becomes a form of resource to the NGOs. Most of the activities crafted by 'FTC' and Stairway are centered around human rights, and as shown in the above sections, these become a way for the NGOs to create spaces where the children can share their stories. In this way, the language manages to create a space of trust:

"I support the idea that children should be aware of their rights. And also, just having an avenue or a platform where the children can raise their concerns and have some guidance. Just knowing that if something is wrong – there are someone who are looking out for you. This is useful for not only the children but also the families. It's empowering to know that you have rights [...]" (FTC L 2022, 2).

Based on the material this thesis argues that human rights as both a language and activities become spaces of safety to the children. The human rights oriented activities serve as a sense of protection of the children.

However, one can be critical of this discourse of human rights applied by the NGOs. A criticism could be that one risk of having a language that is not always consistent with the reality and political landscape. An example of this is, how the Philippines has several laws implemented to protect children from any harm, but these laws are far from always upheld (DIGNITY 2018, 5). This may have the consequence that human rights lose some of the power it otherwise tends to have as a universal language among humanity (Jensen 2016, 1). The question is then whether human rights as a universal language can capture the lives of the children. According to anthropologist Tobias Kelly, one of the disadvantages of using human rights as a universal language is that it tends to be a technical and narrow language that can be exclusive to the lived life (Kelly 2012, 18). With this claim, one might risk reducing the children's experiences of torture and other forms of violence to a language of human rights. With this, I am aware of the existing criticism that exist within the academic field of human rights. However, one need to be aware of what role the language has. In other words, is its purpose to create justice or a way of approaching traumatic experiences among the children? The discussion of the material collected in this fieldwork point towards the latter. A counter argument to the above is thus that the way the NGOs use human rights as a language becomes a way of approaching the children and shedding light on hidden practices that children daily suffer under. Furthermore, human rights even become a way of addressing the everyday violence, as it, through this awareness of the rights, becomes clear how the everyday violence is violating children's lives. In this sense, it becomes a window into the children's reality that normally is difficult to access. An important aspect of this is then to translate this knowledge and awareness from these spaces into real life.

Chapter 6: Conclusion

With a dynamic approach, this thesis project has examined places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children in the Philippines. Furthermore, the project has analyzed and discussed how different NGOs understand, experience, and utilize the concepts of place and space in their work with children being subjected to torture and other forms of violence.

Based on the literature review of the existing literature within the field of torture and other forms of violence against children, it is shown how particular torture against children, but also other forms of violence, are hidden practices. NGOs have for decades tried to shed light on these hidden practices through their work and engagement in the field. DIGNITY, Balay and CLRDC are examples of NGOs who take part in this struggle and fight against torture and other forms of violence against children. Likewise, Stairway is an example of an NGO that takes part in the fight against violence and exploitation against children. Stairway as a voice of more than 30 years of experience turned out to be a source of understanding the places and spaces as well as the movements of the children in particularly Manila. Together, the four NGOs manage in different ways to shed light on this hidden practice through their work and engagement with the children. Therefore, it has been crucial to include these actors in my fieldwork to gain a more nuanced understanding of the issue as well as the situation of the children.

Places in the lives of marginalized children in Manila are determined by a daily struggle for survival. These places are characterized by a constant motion of the children, as marginalized children in Manila are found in several places in the pursuit of survival. These are primarily public places, which can be divided into two types; one is a visible place, in which the children move between crowds of people and traffic to make a living. The other one is more hidden and thus becomes a way for the children to hide from the public eye, people, and often encounters of violence. In this way, these places can also be divided into places of unsafety and a search for safety. Yet both places being a question of survival. In particular, the notion of safe and unsafe places and spaces is a key theme identified in the analysis, which ultimately shows that places and spaces are influenced by this exact question of safety. Understanding safe places and spaces is complex, as they exist in different forms. Based on the analysis it can be concluded that one of the safe places for the children, is being among peers. Hence, the children themselves become safe places to each other. Another identified safe place to the children are NGOs, who helps the children. The NGOs as places are interesting, as they are referred to as spaces instead of places by the informants. Hence, it can be concluded that there is a shift from place to space when discussing how the NGOs understand and utilize the concepts of place and space in their work with the children. These safe places are thus transformed into safe spaces.

The 'FTC' team and Stairway work in particular places but through their work with the children it is shown that they manage to go beyond these places. Activities such as theater, art, games, dance, and

education are ways in which the NGOs use place and space in their work with the children. Through these activities, they aim at creating trust and in that way it also becomes a way in which the NGOs orient themselves towards creating safe spaces for the children. The activities thus become an important tool for the NGOs, when they work with the children, but to the children it becomes a safe space creating a wordless language. Moreover, by drawing on theory from Yi-Fu Tuan and Michel de Certeau, it is indicated that safe spaces for the children are more than just places transformed into spaces. With Tuan's understanding of place as something with a meaning and a way of being in the world, it opens up for people to be considered as places. Yet, with Certeau's dynamic approach, people become spaces. With this it is argued that the NGOs become safe spaces to the children through the anchoring of the activities. In this way, safe spaces are shown to be both about the people and the atmosphere as well as the practice of places transforming them into spaces.

Another way in which the NGOs approach the children is through the use of human rights. Human rights are shown to be a common language in which the NGOs, across their different field of expertise, can approach not only the children but also the unspeakable of torture and other forms of violence. This creates an awareness among the children, who then creates a language based on the human rights in which they can approach, process, and share their past experiences. Furthermore, the human rights oriented approaches become a way for the NGOs to create safe spaces for the children as well as understand the everyday violence, the children suffer from. Based on the analysis and discussion it is concluded that the activities and approaches centered around human rights become a way for the NGOs to create a sense of protection and safety.

The thesis shows that NGOs work in concrete places, which in their work with the children are transformed into spaces. In this way these places become dynamic, as they are changeable. This is where Michel de Certeau's dynamic understanding of place and space come into play. This dynamic approach is proven to be relevant in more ways than just understanding the activities of the NGOs. The concepts of place and space emerge namely in several ways when examining the collected material. Places of the children are characterized by a dynamic dimension, as the children encounter places in a constant motion. The 'in-between' places are shown to be places created in an encounter between the children and the city, which is often encounters of violence. With this it is argued that the 'in-between' places are characterized by a high risk of violence. In addition, this indicates an importance of understanding places of the children in relation to violence. Furthermore, the 'in-

between' places are proven to be places that are made and remade, as they are places created in the motion of the children and people of encounters. With Michel de Certeau's theoretical lens on places and spaces, it becomes possible to understand these 'in-between' places in another way allowing a transformation of place into space. With this, it is argued that 'in-between' places become spaces, since they are dynamic and practiced by the children and people they encounter. Furthermore, it can be concluded that by understanding the 'in-between' places as spaces, they become more accessible for NGOs to work in. This is important because it creates new opportunities, in which the NGO can enter the otherwise inaccessible 'in-between' places in a more practical manner by having activities that makes these places more safe for the children.

Being 'out-of-place' is another concept describing the children's positions and situations. As the children are found in many different places, they are in some sense not belonging to one particular place. Yet, the children long for this sense of belonging, which they then try to create through being with other children and in this way create a sense of belonging and safety. The material shows that the NGOs aim at creating an alternative to this being 'out-of-place' by creating a sense of belongingness to the children through their activities. It can thus be concluded that when it comes to working with the children, place and space are crucial concepts.

The thesis thus concludes that places provide a setting for spaces to be explored. Places and spaces in the lives of marginalized children become an important part of the NGOs work with creating safe spaces for the children. This is made possible by the spatial perspective, where a dynamic approach allows an exchange between place and space. Space is thus not separated from place, as the way in which the NGOs utilize places in their work, creates spaces. Drawing on the theoretical framework and collected material, it is concluded how a dynamic understanding of place and space can provide an insight into the NGOs work with marginalized children in the Philippines being subjected to torture and other forms of violence.

6.1 Reflections

When reflecting upon this thesis project, including the methodological approach as well as the findings from the analysis and discussion, it is necessary to emphasize that this study is not a one-sided truth. Yet, it provides an understanding of the situations and lives of marginalized children in the Philippines; a life and a situation which is described through the perspective of NGOs as actors.

MA Thesis Project – International Studies Supervisor: Annette Skovsted Hansen

If I were to take this thesis project further, it would be relevant to include other actors, such as the children themselves, to be able to provide a broader and deeper perspective on the understanding and experience of how places are transformed into spaces in the NGOs' work with the children. In other words, how do children experience these spaces that are created through activities and human rights. However, this thesis project is still qualified and relevant since the NGOs bring both years of expertise and knowledge to the table. Based on this, it can be concluded that the use of NGOs as actors and as informants in this thesis project has provided a broad and comprehensive knowledge, which has been fruitful for both the analysis and discussion. However, including the voices of the children directly instead of representing them through the NGOs, could have given yet another dimension and understanding.

List of References

Aarhus University. 2019. "Hvorfor 'Delphini" logo used on frontpage <u>https://projects.au.dk/da/ausatdk/delphini1dk/baggrundsoplysninger/hvorfor-delphini</u> Accessed 27.05.22

About Balay. 2022. "About Us" https://balayph.net/about-us/who-we-are Accessed 26.04.22

About CLRDC. 2022. "About" https://clrdc.wordpress.com/about/ Accessed 07.05.22

About DIGNITY. 2022. "About DIGNITY" <u>https://www.dignity.dk/en/about-dignity/</u> Accessed 26.04.22

About Stairway. 2022. "About Us" <u>https://www.stairwayfoundation.org/about-us/</u> Accessed 26.04.22

Alayarian, Aida. 2009. "Children, torture and psychological consequences." *TORTURE Volume 19*, Number 2, 2009: 145-156.

Amnesty International. 2000. "Hidden scandal, secret shame. Torture and ill-treatment of children" in *Amnesty International Publications* (2000).

Asian Development Bank Staff. 2009. "Executive Summary" in *Poverty in the Philippines: Causes, Constraints and Opportunities*. PP. 1-6. The Philippines: Asian Development Bank Institute.

Attride-Stirling, Jennifer. 2001. "Thematic networks: an analytic tool for qualitative research" *Qualitative Research* vol. 1(3): 385-405. SAGE Publications.

Baagø-Rasmussen, Line. 2012. *Untold stories: child torture - addressing a horrific practice*. 1. oplag. ed. Copenhagen: IRCT - International Rehabilitation Council for Torture Victims.

Bernard, H. R. 1994. "Unstructured and Semi-structured Interviewing". In *Research Methods in Anthropology. Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. PP. 156-186. London: Sage.

Bryman, Alan. 2012. "Chapter 18. Sampling in qualitative research" in *Social Research Methods*.4th ed. PP. 415-429. The United States: Oxford University Press.

Certeau, Michel de. 1988. "Chapter IX – Spatial Stories" in *The practice of everyday life*. Translated by Steven Rendall. PP. 115-130. Berkeley, Calif;: University of California Press. (Original work published in 1984).

CLRDC. 2020. "How Could They Do This To My Child?" https://www.omct.org/files/2020/06/25937/omct_philippines_childrights_06.2020_en_single.pdf Accessed 22.04.22

Courant. 2022. "Aarhus University Logo" used on frontpage <u>https://courant.dk/forside/aarhus-university-logo/</u> Accessed 27.05.22

Cresswell, Tim. 1996. "Chapter 1. Introduction" in *In Place/Out of Place: Geography, Ideology, and Transgression*. PP. 3-10. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Cresswell, Tim. 2014. "Place" in *The SAGE Handbook of Human Geography: Two Volume Set*, edited by Roger Lee, Noel Castree, Rob Kitchin, Victoria Lawson, Anssi Paasi, Chris Philo, Sarah Radcliffe, Susan M. Roberts & Charles W.J. Withers. PP. 3-21. London: SAGE Publications Ltd

Cresswell, Tim. 2015. Place: An introduction. 2nd ed. Chichester, England: Wiley Blackwell.

DIGNITY. 2018: "Annex A.2 – Grant application form – Full application". *A project document*. Copenhagen: DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture.

DIGNITY. 2022. "DIGNITY Logo" used on frontpage <u>https://www.dignity.dk/en/</u> Accessed 27.05.22

Emerson, Robert; Fretz, Rachel & Shaw, Linda. 2010. "In the Field: Participating, Observing, and Jotting Notes" in *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes*. PP. 17-38. Chicago: Chicago University.

FTC Activity Report June. 2021. "SO2114. June 2021. 1st CICL Orientation on HR (doubled circulation)". *Project Documents*. Accessed through DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture.

FTC Activity Report May. 2021. "SO2112. May 2021. Visioning in BPA (Part 2)". *Project Documents*. Accessed through DIGNITY – Danish Institute Against Torture.

FTC E. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Skype interview" 01.03.22.

FTC I. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Skype interview" 10.03.22.

FTC L. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Teams interview" 24.03.22.

FTC O. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Teams interview" 05.03.22.

FTC S. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Teams interview" 03.03.22.

FTC X. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Skype interview" 05.04.22.

FTC Y. 2022. Informant from the 'FTC' project. "Skype interview" 10.03.22.

Hubbard, Phil & Kitchin, Rob. 2011. "Introduction: Why Key Thinkers?" in *Key thinkers on space and place*, edited by Rob Kitchin, Phil Hubbard. PP. 1-17. 2. ed. London: SAGE.

Human Rights Watch. 2020: "Philippine Children Face Abuse for Violating COVID-19 Curfew". *Human Rights Watch*. <u>https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/04/03/philippine-children-face-abuse-violating-covid-19-curfew</u> Accessed 30.04.22

Human Rights Watch. 2021: "World Report 2021: Philippines" https://www.hrw.org/worldreport/2021/country-chapters/philippines#4e7414 Accessed 19.05.22 IT Support AU. 2021. "Processing personal data in projects etc." <u>https://studerende.au.dk/en/it-support/information-security/data-protection-gdpr/projects</u> Accessed 02.05.22

James, Nalita & Busher, Hugh. 2012. "Chapter 11. Internet Interviewing" in *The Sage handbook of interview research: the complexity of the craft*, edited by Jaber F. Gubrium, James A. Holstein, Amir B. Marvasti & Karyn D. McKinney. PP. 177-191. 2. ed. Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Jensen, Steven L. B. 2016. "Chapter 1. Negotiating Universality" in *The Making of International Human Rights: The 1960s, Decolonization, and the Reconstruction of Global Values*. PP. 1-17. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.

Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines. 2006. "REPUBLIC ACT No. 9344. 2006: Section 4. *Definition of Terms* (d)" <u>https://www.lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2006/ra_9344_2006.html</u> Accessed 19.05.22

Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines. 2006. "REPUBLIC ACT No. 9344. 2006: Section 4. *Definition of Terms* (e)" <u>https://www.lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2006/ra_9344_2006.html</u> Accessed 19.05.22

Juvenile Justice and Welfare Act of the Philippines. 2013. "REPUBLIC ACT No. 10630. 2013: Section 2. *Definition of Terms* (s)" https://lawphil.net/statutes/repacts/ra2013/ra_10630_2013.html Accessed 19.05.22

Jørgensen 2022. Email exchange between author and Jørgensen, February 4, 2022.

Kelly, Tobias. 2012. "Introduction" in *This Side of Silence. Human Rights, Torture, and the Recognition of Cruelty*. PP. 1-24. University of Pennsylvania Press.

Kvale, Steinar & Brinkmann, Svend. 2008. "Kapitel 7. Udførelse af et Interview" PP. 143-162 and "Kapitel 10. Transskription af interview" in *InterView - Learning the Craft of Qualitative Research*

Interviewing (translated from *Interview: introduktion til et håndværk*) PP. 199-210. 2. ed. København: Hans Reitzel.

Legaspi-Medina, Rowena. 2020. "Chapter 6. Legal implementation. The missing piece of the puzzle in safeguarding children from violence in the Philippines" in *Violence Against Children in the Criminal Justice System. Global Perspectives on Prevention*, edited by Wendy O'Brien and Cédric Foussard. 1 Edition. ed. *Routledge frontiers of criminal justice*. New York: Routledge.

Lenta, Patrick. 2017. "Is Corporal Punishment Torturous?" *Journal of applied philosophy*, 34 (1), 2017: 74-88.

Marc, B. 2016. "Torture: Child Torture" *Encyclopedia of Forensic and Legal Medicine, Volume 4*, 2016. Centre hospitalier de Marne-la-Vallée, Jossigny, France: Elsevier Ltd.

OMCT 2021. "Best Practices to Protect Children Against Torture in Detention". A global guide for prevention and protection of children against torture published by OMCT – World Organization Against Torture.

OMCT & CLRDC. 2020. "How Could They Do This To My Child?" https://www.omct.org/files/2020/06/25937/omct_philippines_childrights_06.2020_en_single.pdf Accessed 22.04.22

Pérez-Sales, Pau. 2019. "Documentation of torture in children and young adults: Time to reflect." *TORTURE Volume 29*, (1), 2019: 1-15. Copenhagen: The International Rehabilitation Council for Torture Victims (IRCT).

Philippine Statistics Authority. 2021. "Latest Releases" <u>https://psa.gov.ph/poverty-press-releases</u> Accessed 21.05.22

Pink, Sarah. 2016. "Chapter 1. Ethnography in a Digital World" in *Digital Ethnography: Principles and Practice*. PP. 1-18. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Quiroga, José. 2009. "Torture in children" TORTURE Volume 19 (2), 2009: 66-87.

SFI A. 2022. Informant from Stairway Foundation. "Skype interview" 14.03.22.

SFI B. 2022. Informant from Stairway Foundation. "Skype interview" 11.03.22.

SFI F. 2022. Informant from Stairway Foundation. "Skype interview" 08.04.22.

SFI H. 2022. Informant from Stairway Foundation. "Messenger interview" 09.04.22.

SFI R. 2022. Informant from Stairway Foundation. "Messenger interview" 31.03.22.

Sovacool, Benjamin K; Axsen, John & Sorrell, Steve. 2018. "Promoting novelty, rigor, and style in energy social science: Towards codes of practice for appropriate methods and research design" *Energy Research & Social Science Volume 45* (2018): 12–42.

Stairway Animation Film Toolkit. 2022. <u>https://www.stairwayfoundation.org/programs-and-activities/break-the-silence/animation-film-toolkits/</u> Accessed 27.05.22

Stairway Family Home. 2022. <u>https://www.stairwayfoundation.org/programs-and-activities/family-home/</u> Accessed 27.05.22

Staub, Sarah. 2021. "Literature overview – Children and Torture" *An overview on existing literature, key debates, and gaps in the field*. Copenhagen: Unpublished work produced for DIGNITY during the internship.

Tuan, Yi-Fu. 2018. *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience*. 9. Printing, 2018. ed. Minneapolis, Minn: University of Minnesota Press. (Original work published in 1977).

Turner, Victor. 1967. "Betwix and Between: The Liminal Period in Rites de Passage" in *The Forest* of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual. PP. 93-111. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press

UNICEF Philippines. 2016. "Child protection. Ensuring children and adolescents grow up in a safe and protective environment" <u>https://www.unicef.org/philippines/child-protection</u> Accessed 29.05.22

UNICEF Philippines. 2021. "Chapter 3. Findings" in *Effects of COVID-19 on child poverty and efficacy of social protection responses in the Philippines. Component 1: Ex-ante micro simulations on child poverty and social amelioration programme.* UNICEF Philippines.

United Nations. 1984. "Article 1" United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment https://www.ohchr.org/en/professionalinterest/pages/cat.aspx Accessed 28.02.22

United Nations. 1989. "Article 1" UN Convention on the Rights of the Child https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/convention-rights-child Accessed 28.02.22

United Nations. 1989. "Article 19" UN Convention on the Rights of the Child https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/convention-rights-child Accessed 28.02.22

World Population Review. 2022. "Manila Population 2022" https://worldpopulationreview.com/world-cities/manila-population Accessed 15.05.22

Wurth, Margaret & Conde, H. Carlos. 2020. "Philippine Children Face Abuse for Violating COVID-19 Curfew". *Human Rights Watch*. <u>https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/04/03/philippine-children-face-abuse-violating-covid-19-curfew</u> Accessed 07.05.22

Yin, Robert K. 2009. "Chapter 2. Designing Case Studies: Identifying Your Case(s) and
Establishing the Logic of Your Case Study" in *Case study research: design and methods*. PP. 2566. 4. ed. ed, *Applied social research methods series; 5.* Los Angeles: Sage Publications.

Appendix 1: Consent Forms for Interview

Consent form

Student: Sarah Staub E-mail: XX Telephone: XX

Project title (tentative): Pattern of movement among children – a dynamic understanding of place, space, and children and how this can create an understanding of torture and other forms of violence against children.¹¹

Supervisor Aarhus University: Annette Skovsted Hansen Supervisor e-mail: XX

Co-Supervisor DIGNITY: Tomas Max Martin Co-Supervisor e-mail: XX

The project is conducted as part of the student's training at the Department of Global Studies at Aarhus University, as a part of the final Master Thesis Project.

- I hereby allow Sarah Staub to use the contents of conversations, interviews or observations in connection with her master thesis project.
- If data from the interview(s) with me or other personal data are used in the project's written exams/reports, they will be anonymized and handled with sensitivity before they are shared with supervisors, examiners, and/or others.
- I understand that I can withdraw my consent at any time in the future. In case consent is revoked, the data will be erased from the project. Consent can be withdrawn by contacting the student and/or the student's supervisors.
- I understand that I can access the material in which the data from interview(s) with me appear. I can thus raise any concerns that I may have against this.
- By giving my consent, I accept that the collected material may be used, in anonymized form, for further dissemination of results, for example as part of a public talk or an article.

¹¹ Note: this was the working title for the thesis project.

Date — Name — Signature

Consent on behalf of minors or others unable to provide own consent:

Please indicate whether you are signing on behalf of minors or others who are not in a legal position to provide their own consent (please circle yes or no): YES / NO If yes, please provide the name(s) of the relevant minors/person(s)_____

Use of photographs: In case photographs are used in the project, do you allow the use of pictures of you *but where you cannot be identified* to be used in exams, talks or publications building on the study? (please circle yes or no) YES / NO